## Interoffice Memo

To: J. Winston Krause, Chairman
Carmen Arrieta-Candelaria, Commissioner
Peggy A. Heeg, Commissioner
Doug Lowe, Commissioner
Robert Rivera, Commissioner
From: Bob Biard, General Counsel Pest

Date: July 11, 2016
Re: Consideration of the Status and Possible Approval of Orders in Enforcement Cases

The Legal Services Division staff recommends that the Commission approve each of the proposed orders in the enforcement cases presented under this item.

## Commission Order No. 16-0035

Date: JULY 11, 2016
DOCKET NO. 362-16-1202 et al.

## IN THE MATTER OF <br> THE REVOCATION OF CERTAIN LOTTERY RETAILER LICENSES <br> ORDER OF THE COMMISSION

During open meeting at Austin, Texas, the Texas Lottery Commission finds that after proper and timely notice was given, the above-styled cases were heard by Administrative Law Judges who made and filed Proposals for Decision containing the Administrative Law Judge's Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law. The Proposals for Decision were properly served and all parties were given an opportunity to file exceptions and replies as part of the record herein.

The Texas Lottery Commission, after review and due consideration of the Proposals for Decision, and exceptions and replies filed, if any, adopts the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law of the Administrative Law Judges as if fully set out and separately stated herein, except for the following item. The Proposal for Decision in reference to State Line Oil Co. D/B/A State Line Oil Co., Docket Number 362-16-2444, contained a technical error in that the insufficient funds amount in Finding of Fact 6(a) is incorrectly stated as $\$ 6,208.37$. The correct amount is $\$ 6,208.63$. The insufficient funds amount in Finding of Fact 6(a) is hereby changed to note the correct amount as $\$ 6,208.63$. Tex. Gov't Code Ann. § 2001.058(e)(3) authorizes a state agency to change technical errors in a Proposal for Decision's Findings of Fact. All proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law not specifically adopted herein are hereby denied.

## Date: JULY 11, 2016

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED that the licenses for the Lottery Retailers listed on Attachment A, which is incorporated into this Order for all purposes, are hereby revoked.

Passed and approved at the regular meeting of the Texas Lottery Commission at Austin, Texas, on the $11^{\mathrm{TH}}$ day of JULY, 2016.

Entered this $11^{\mathrm{TH}}$ day of JULY, 2016.

> J. WINSTON KRAUSE, CHAIRMAN

CARMEN ARRIETA-CANDELARIA, COMMISSIONER

PEGGY A. HEEG, COMMISSIONER

DOUG LOWE, COMMISSIONER

ROBERT RIVERA, COMMISSIONER

## ATTACHMENT A

| Tab NO. | SOAH DOCKET <br> NO. | LOTTERY RETAILER | LOTTERY <br> LICENSE NO. |
| :---: | :---: | :--- | :---: |
| A. | $362-16-1202$ |  <br> A Grocery | 177655 |
| B. | $362-16-2444$ | State Line Oil Co. D/B/A State <br> Line Oil Co. | 298200 |
| C. | $362-16-2443$ | SSJ Fuel, Inc. D/B/A Handi Stop <br> \#102 | 177018 |
| D. | $362-16-2636$ | Oxnoble, LLC D/B/A Oxnoble <br> Liquor | 153115 |
| E. | $362-16-2637$ | Raya Trading Inc. D/B/A Sunmart <br> \#194 | 173479 |
| F. | $362-16-2638$ | D \& H Food Mart Inc. D/B/A <br> Bengal Mart | 178078 |
| G. | $362-16-2639$ | JB Super Stop Inc. D/B/A Tiger's <br> Den | 178370 |
| H. | $362-16-2640$ | Campos Guerrero LLC D/B/A <br> Campos Meat Market | 178486 |
| I. | $362-16-2641$ | First Interactive Inc. D/B/A I-35 <br> Texaco | 180073 |
| J. | $362-16-3265$ | Keyaan Enterprise Inc. D/B/A La <br> Viva Grocery | 178381 |
| K. | $362-16-3590$ | GSA C-Stores Inc. D/B/A Saving <br> Food Store | 151465 |

## State Office of Administrative Hearings

<br>Cathleen Parsley<br>Chief Administrative Law Judge

## 

April 4, 2016

Gary Grief
VIA EMAIL
Executive Director
Texas Lottery Commission
611 East 6th Street
Austin, Texas 78701
RE: Docket No. 362-16-1202; Texas Lottery Commission v. Bhatti's Grocery, LLC, Agent, d/b/a S \& A Grocery, License No. 177655

Dear Mr. Grief:
Please find enclosed a Proposal for Decision in this case. It contains my recommendation and underlying rationale.

Exceptions and replies may be filed by any party in accordance with Texas Administrative Code title $1, \S 155.507$ (c), a SOAH rule found at <www.soah.state.tx.us>.


GWE/Ls
cc: $\quad$ Stephen White, Assistant General Counsel, Texas Lottery Commission, 611 E. $6^{\text {ht }}$, Austin Texas 78701 - VIA E-MAIL Bhatti's Grocery, LLC, 2498 Calder Street, Beaumont, TX 77702 -VIA REGULAR MAlL

300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Suite 502, Austin, Texas 78701/ P.O. Box 13025, Austin, Texas 78711-3025
512.475 .4993 (Main) 512.475.3445 (Docketing) 512.322.2061 (Fax)
www.soah.state.tx.us

## SOAH DOCKET NO. 362-16-1202

| TEXAS LOTTERY COMMISSION, | $\S$ | BEFORE THE STATE OFFICE |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| $\quad$ Petitioner | $\S$ |  |
|  | $\S$ | OF |
| v. | $\S$ |  |
|  | $\S$ |  |
| BHATTI'S GROCERY LLC, AGENT, | $\S$ |  |
| DBA S\&A GROCERY, | $\S$ |  |
| Respondent | $\S$ | ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS |

## PROPOSAL FOR DECISION

The staff (Staff) of the Texas Lottery Commission (Commission) seeks the revocation of the Texas Lottery Sales Agent license of Bhatti's Grocery, LLC, d/b/a S\&A Grocery (S\&A) based on its conclusion that $S \& A$ 's license was summarily suspended four times in a 12-month period for insufficient funds or non-transfer of funds, and because S\&A still owes the State approximately $\$ 1600$ from lottery sales. Based on the evidence, the Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) concludes that Staff proved its allegations and that S\&A's license should be revoked.

## I. DISCUSSION

## A. Evidence

Pursuant to 16 Texas Administrative Code $\S 401.353(\mathrm{~b})$, each lottery retailer shall maintain an account balance sufficient to cover moneys due the Commission for the established billing period. The moneys are collected by electronic funds transfers that occur when the account is "swept" by the Commission. In the event a retailer fails to maintain a sufficient account balance to cover an electronic sweep for the established billing period, the retailer's license shall be summarily suspended. If a retailer's license is summarily suspended four times in a 12-month period for insufficient funds or non-transfer of funds, the retailer's license shall be revoked.

On four occasions from May 13, 2015, to October 21, 2015, the Commission unsuccessfully swept the bank account dedicated to S\&A's lottery sales. S\&A's retailer's license was summarily suspended on each occasion. Fred Petri, an Account Manager IV for the Commission, affirmed that neither the applicable statute nor the Commission's rules address any circumstances that would absolve a retailer of responsibility from an unsuccessful account sweep. Nonetheless, he acknowledged, the Commission has adopted the informal practice of not holding the retailer responsible in the event of bank error. The Commission has a form letter that the appropriate bank representative may complete and submit to the Commission in the event an error prevented the Commission's sweep. Despite being given the option of having its bank submit such a letter, Mr. Petri explained, S\&A failed to do so.

Fatehali Marchant, S\&A's store manager who appeared on S\&A's behalf, acknowledged that the retailer's bank account was on hold at times. He insisted, however, that the account had funds in it around the times it was swept. In support of the assertion, he submitted bank statements into evidence that reflected positive account balances around the time of the two sweeps in October 2015. In regard to Commission records that designated the October 2015 sweeps as "Uncollected," Mr. Marchant asked Mr. Petri whether the Commission had any records indicating that S\&A's bank account had insufficient funds at the time of the sweeps. He was told that, although the records did not specify that the account contained insufficient funds, there was no legally significant distinction between whether the attempted sweep of S\&A's account was unsuccessful because of insufficient funds or another problem.

Staff argued that, ultimately, it is the retailer's obligation to ensure both that it has sufficient funds in its account at the time of an electronic sweep, and that no other circumstances would preclude a successful sweep, such as a hold being placed on the account. Mr. Marchant asserted that, notwithstanding Staff's assertions, S\&A should prevail because it had enough money in its account at the time of the sweeps.

## B. Analysis and Conclusion

S\&A's lottery sales agent license should be revoked. Although S\&A may have had funds in its account around the time of the two unsuccessful sweeps by the Commission in October 2015, the Commission was unable to access the account. Even though the Commission was able to access the account during sweeps attempted on May 13, 2015, and June 17, 2015, the account did not have sufficient funds to cover the sweep on those dates. In response to Mr. Marchant's repeated inquiry into whether the Commission could show that S\&A did not contain sufficient funds in its account during the two attempted October sweeps, Staff pointed out that it does not have access to retailer's account balances when funds are uncollectible. Notwithstanding the reason the Commission is unable to collect funds during a sweep, Staff correctly pointed out that it is not the Commission's responsibility to determine why it is unable to collect funds during an attempted sweep. Instead, it is required to show only that an attempt was unsuccessful. At 16 Texas Administrative Code § 401.352(a), the Commission's rules address the retailer's responsibilities regarding funds collected from lottery sales:
(a) The commission may require a retailer to establish a single separate electronic funds transfer account, where available, for the purpose of receiving monies from ticket sales, making payments to the commission and receiving payments from the commission. Failure to have sufficient funds available to cover an electronic funds transfer to the commission's account shall be cause for suspension, summary suspension and revocation of a retailer's license at each location where such retailer is licensed. Further, if a check or electronic transfer of funds to the commission is dishonored, the commission may take any and all actions authorized by law, including requiring the retailer to pay a service charge and collection and litigation expenses.

Although S\&A was given the opportunity to provide a letter from its bank explaining that bank error was the cause of the failed sweeps, it did not do so. Based on this failure, combined with Mr. Marchant's concession that there were times when S\&A's account was placed "onhold," the ALJ concludes that S\&A violated § 401.353 (b) of the Commission's rules by failing to transfer funds due the Commission during each of the attempted sweeps. Because its retailer's license was summarily suspended for non-transfer of funds four times in a 12-month period, the license should be revoked as provided in $\S 401.353$ (e).

## II. FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Bhatti's Grocery, LLC, $\mathrm{d} / \mathrm{b} / \mathrm{a}$ S\&A Grocery ( $\mathrm{S} \& A$ ) is a lottery sales agent licensed by the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). S\&A holds license number 177655.
2. On November 19, 2015, the Commission's staff (Staff) issued a notice of hearing informing S\&A of the hearing date, the location of the hearing, the allegations it intended to prove, and the law applicable to the allegations. S\&A received the notice.
3. The hearing convened and closed before Administrative Law Judge Gary Elkins on February 4, 2016, at the State Office of Administrative Hearings, located in the William P. Clements Building, 300 West $15^{\text {th }}$ Street in Austin, Texas.
4. Fatehali Marchant appeared at the hearing on behalf of S\&A. Staff appeared and was represented by Stephen White, assistant general counsel.
5. On the following dates, Respondent failed to electronically transfer funds to the Commission and owed the Commission the amounts listed below for the sale of lottery tickets:
(a) May 13, 2015, in the amount of $\$ 166.90$;
(b) June 17, 2015, in the amount of $\$ 514.00$;
(c) October 15,2015 , in the amount of $\$ 92.87$;
(d) October 21, 2015, in the amount of $\$ 467.00$.
6. Respondent's retailer license was summarily suspended for non-transfer of funds four times within a 12-month period.

## III. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Commission has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to the Texas Lottery Act (the Act), Texas Government Code § 466.155.
2. The State Office of Administrative Hearings has jurisdiction over matters related to the hearing in this proceeding, including the authority to issue a Proposal for Decision with Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, as provided by Texas Government Code chapter 2003.
3. Proper and timely notice of the hearing was effected upon S\&A pursuant to Texas Government Code §§ 2001.051-2001.052, § 466.155(b) of the Act, and 16 Texas Administrative Code § $401.205(a)(4)$.
4. S\&A violated 16 Texas Administrative Code § 401.352, which requires a lottery retailer to have sufficient funds on deposit to cover electronic sweeps conducted by the Commission.
5. Pursuant to $\S 466.155$ of the Act and 16 Texas Administrative Code $\S \S 401.158$ and 401.352(a), the Commission has authority to suspend or revoke a lottery sales agent's license for the violations described in the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law.
6. Because S\&A's retailer license was summarily suspended for non-transfer of funds four times within a 12 -month period, the license should be revoked as provided at 16 Texas Administrative Code § 401.158(b)(10).

SIGNED April 4, 2016.


# State Office of Administrative Hearings 

$\because$ GF: fic ?
2016 MAR 23 A A 9: 35


## Cathleen Parsley

Chief Administrative Law Judge

March 23, 2016

Gary Grief
Executive Director
Texas Lottery Commission
611 East 6th Street
Austin, Texas 78701
VIA E-MAIL

## RE: SOAH Docket No. 362-16-2444; Texas Lottery Commission v. State Line Oil Co., Agent d/b/a State Line Oil Co., Sales Agent License No. 298200

Dear Mr. Grief:
Please find enclosed a Proposal for Decision in this case. It contains my recommendation and underlying rationale.

Exceptions and replies may be filed by any party in accordance with Texas Administrative Code title $1, \S 155.507$ (c), a SOAH rule found at <www.soah.state.tx.us>.


HSS/vg
Enclosure
$\begin{array}{ll}\text { cc: } & \text { Kristen Guthrie, Assistant General Counsel, Texas Lottery Commission, } 611 \text { E. } 6^{\text {th }} \text {, Austin Texas } 78701-\text { VIA E- } \\ & \frac{\text { MAIL }}{\text { State Line Oil Co., Agent d/b/a State Line Oil Co., P.O. Box 2201, Hobbs, NM } 88240-\text { YIA REGULAR MAIL }}\end{array}$

300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Suite 502, Austin, Texas 78701/ P.O. Box 13025, Austin, Texas 78711-3025 512.475.4993 (Main) 512.475.3445 (Docketing) 512.322.2061 (Fax) www.soah.state.tx.us

| TEXAS LOTTERY COMMISSION | $\S$ | BEFORE THE STATE OFFICE |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| LOTTERY OPERATIONS DIVISION, | $\S$ |  |
| $\quad$ Petitioner | $\S$ |  |
|  | $\S$ |  |
| V. | $\S$ | OF |
|  | $\S$ |  |
| STATE LINE OIL CO., AGENT | $\S$ |  |
| D/B/A STATE LINE OIL CO. | $\S$ |  |
| SALES AGENT LICENSE NO. 298200, | $\S$ |  |
| $\quad$ Respondent | $\S$ | ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS |

## PROPOSAL FOR DECISION

The staff of the Texas Lottery Commission (Staff) seeks the revocation of a lottery sales agent's license held by State Line Oil Co., Agent d/b/a State Line Oil Co. (Licensee) on the grounds that it failed to have sufficient funds available to cover electronic funds transfers to the account of the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). The Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) recommends revocation of the license.

On March 3, 2016, a hearing to consider Staff's allegations was conducted by ALJ Howard S. Seitzman, at the State Office of Administrative Hearings, William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas. Staff appeared through Kristen Guthrie, Assistant General Counsel for the Commission. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing. After Staff established jurisdiction and notice as required by law, the hearing proceeded on a default basis. Therefore, the allegations and applicable law are discussed only in the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law below.

## I. FINDINGS OF FACT

1. State Line Oil Co., Agent d/b/a State Line Oil Co. (Licensee), Hobbs, NM, is a lottery sales agent licensed by the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). Licensee holds license number 298200.
2. On February 11, 2016, staff of the Commission sent notice of hearing informing Licensee of the final hearing date, location of the hearing, and the allegations it intended to prove at the hearing; the notice was sent by certified mail, return receipt requested to Licensee's address as it appears in the Commission's records.
3. The notice of hearing advised Licensee in 12-point bold face type that failure to appear at the hearing would result in the factual allegations in the notice being admitted as true, and that the relief sought in the notice may be granted by default.
4. The hearing described in Finding of Fact No. 2 was held on March 3, 2016, in the William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas.
5. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing.
6. On the following dates Licensee failed to have sufficient funds available to cover an electronic transfer of funds to the Commission's account and owed the Commission the amounts listed below for the sale of lottery tickets:
(a) December 23, 2015, in the amount of $\$ 6,208.37$; and
(b) January 21, 2016, in the amount of $\$ 15,133.44$.
7. The amounts described in Finding of Fact No. 6 were for the sale of lottery tickets less Licensee's commissions and credits for the amounts of cash prizes Licensee paid.

## II. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission) has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to the Texas Lottery Act (the Act), Tex. Gov't Code Ann. § 466.155.
2. The State Office of Administrative Hearings has jurisdiction over matters related to the hearing in this proceeding, including the authority to issue a proposal for decision with proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law, pursuant to Tex. Gov't Code Ann. ch. 2003.
3. Based upon Findings of Fact Nos. 2 and 3, proper and timely notice of the hearing was effected upon Licensee pursuant to the Administrative Procedure Act, Tex. Gov't Code Ann. §§ 2001.051-2001.052, § 466.155(b) of the Act, and 16 Tex. Admin. Code § $401.205(\mathrm{a})(4)$.
4. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 3 and 5, and Conclusion of Law No. 3, a default should be entered against Respondent pursuant to 1 Tex. Admin. Code § 155.501.
5. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 6 and 7, Licensee violated $\S 466.351$ of the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code $\S 401.351$, which require the timely deposit of lottery ticket sales proceeds into a bank account to be held in trust for and owed to the Commission.
6. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 6 and 7, Licensee violated 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 401.352, which requires a licensee to have sufficient funds on deposit to cover electronic transfers of funds to the Commission.
7. Pursuant to the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code $\S \S 401.158$ and 401.352 , the Commission has authority to suspend or revoke a lottery sales agent's license for the violations described in
the foregoing Conclusions of Law.
8. Based on the foregoing Conclusions of Law, the Commission is warranted in revoking Texas Lottery Sales Agent License Number 298200, issued to State Line Oil Co., Agent d/b/a State Line Oil Co. of Hobbs, NM.

SIGNED March 23, 2016.


# State Office of Administrative Hearings 

FMr MED
2016MAR 23 AM 9: 35



Cathleen Parsley<br>Chief Administrative Law Judge

March 23, 2016

Gary Grief
VIA E-MAIL
Executive Director
Texas Lottery Commission
611 East 6th Street
Austin, Texas 78701
RE: SOAH Docket No. 362-16-2443; Texas Lottery Commission v. SSJ Fuel, Inc., Agent d/b/a Handi Stop \#102, Sales Agent License No. 177018

Dear Mr. Grief:
Please find enclosed a Proposal for Decision in this case. It contains my recommendation and underlying rationale.

Exceptions and replies may be filed by any party in accordance with Texas Administrative Code title 1, § 155.507 (c), a SOAH rule found at <www.soah.state.tx.us>.


HSS/vg
Enclosure
cc: $\quad$ Kristen Guthrie, Assistant General Counsel, Texas Lottery Commission, 611 E. $6^{\text {th }}$, Austin Texas 78701 - VIA EMAIL
SSJ Fuel, Inc., Agent d/b/a Handi Stop \#102, 300 E. Villa Maria Road, Bryan, Texas 77801-VIA REGULAR MAIL

300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Suite 502, Austin, Texas 78701/P.O. Box 13025, Austin, Texas 78711-3025 512.475 .4993 (Main) 512.475.3445 (Docketing) 512.322.2061 (Fax)
www.soah.state.tx.us

| TEXAS LOTTERY COMMISSION | $\S$ | BEFORE THE STATE OFFICE |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| LOTTERY OPERATIONS DIVISION, | $\S$ |  |
| $\quad$ Petitioner | $\S$ |  |
|  | $\S$ |  |
| V. | $\S$ |  |
|  | $\S$ |  |
| SSJ FUEL, INC., AGENT | $\S$ |  |
| D/B/A HANDI STOP \#102 | $\S$ |  |
| SALES AGENT LICENSE NO. 177018, | $\S$ |  |
| $\quad$ Respondent | $\S$ | ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS |

## PROPOSAL FOR DECISION

The staff of the Texas Lottery Commission (Staff) seeks the revocation of a lottery sales agent's license held by SSJ Fuel, Inc., Agent d/b/a Handi Stop \#102 (Licensee) on the grounds that it failed to have sufficient funds available to cover electronic funds transfers to the account of the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). The Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) recommends revocation of the license.

On March 3, 2016, a hearing to consider Staff's allegations was conducted by ALJ Howard S. Seitzman, at the State Office of Administrative Hearings, William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas. Staff appeared through Kristen Guthrie, Assistant General Counsel for the Commission. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing. After Staff established jurisdiction and notice as required by law, the hearing proceeded on a default basis. Therefore, the allegations and applicable law are discussed only in the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law below.

## I. FINDINGS OF FACT

1. SSJ Fuel, Inc., Agent d/b/a Handi Stop $\# 102$ (Licensee), Bryan, Texas, is a lottery sales agent licensed by the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). Licensee holds license number 177018.
2. On February 11, 2016, staff of the Commission sent notice of hearing informing Licensee of the final hearing date, location of the hearing, and the allegations it intended to prove at the hearing; the notice was sent by certified mail, return receipt requested to Licensee's address as it appears in the Commission's records.
3. The notice of hearing advised Licensee in 12-point bold face type that failure to appear at the hearing would result in the factual allegations in the notice being admitted as true, and that the relief sought in the notice may be granted by default.
4. The hearing described in Finding of Fact No. 2 was held on March 3, 2016, in the William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas.
5. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing.
6. On the following dates Licensee failed to have sufficient funds available to cover an electronic transfer of funds to the Commission's account and owed the Commission the amounts listed below for the sale of lottery tickets:
(a) December 23, 2015, in the amount of $\$ 2,902.37$;
(b) December 30, 2015, in the amount of $\$ 4,518.32$;
(c) January 13, 2016, in the amount of $\$ 7,553.72$; and
(d) January 21, 2016, in the amount of $\$ 5,421.60$.
7. The amounts described in Finding of Fact No. 6 were for the sale of lottery tickets less Licensee's commissions and credits for the amounts of cash prizes Licensee paid.

## II. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission) has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to the Texas Lottery Act (the Act), Tex. Gov't Code Ann. § 466.155.
2. The State Office of Administrative Hearings has jurisdiction over matters related to the hearing in this proceeding, including the authority to issue a proposal for decision with proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law, pursuant to Tex. Gov't Code Ann. ch. 2003.
3. Based upon Findings of Fact Nos. 2 and 3, proper and timely notice of the hearing was effected upon Licensee pursuant to the Administrative Procedure Act, Tex. Gov't Code Ann. $\S \S 2001.051-2001.052, \S 466.155(\mathrm{~b})$ of the Act, and 16 Tex. Admin. Code § $401.205(\mathrm{a})(4)$.
4. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 3 and 5, and Conclusion of Law No. 3, a default should be entered against Respondent pursuant to 1 Tex. Admin. Code § 155.501.
5. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 6 and 7, Licensee violated § 466.351 of the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code §401.351, which require the timely deposit of lottery ticket sales proceeds into a bank account to be held in trust for and owed to the Commission.
6. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 6 and 7, Licensee violated 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 401.352, which requires a licensee to have sufficient funds on deposit to cover electronic transfers of funds to the Commission.
7. Pursuant to the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code $\S \S 401.158$ and 401.352 , the Commission has authority to suspend or revoke a lottery sales agent's license for the violations described in the foregoing Conclusions of Law.
8. Based on the foregoing Conclusions of Law, the Commission is warranted in revoking Texas Lottery Sales Agent License Number 177018, issued to SSJ Fuel, Inc., Agent d/b/a Handi Stop \#102 of Bryan, Texas.

SIGNED March 23, 2016.


# State Office of Administrative Hearings 



Lesli G. Ginn
Chief Administrative Law Judge
May 5, 2016

Gary Grief
VIA E-MAIL
Executive Director
Texas Lottery Commission
611 East 6th Street
Austin, Texas 78701
RE: Docket No. 362-16-2636; Texas Lottery Commission v. Oxnoble, LLC, Agent, d/b/a Oxnoble Liquor, License No. 153115

Dear Mr. Grief:
Please find enclosed a Proposal for Decision in this case. It contains my recommendation and underlying rationale.

Exceptions and replies may be filed by any party in accordance with Texas Administrative Code title 1, § 155.507 (c), a SOAH rule found at <www.soah.state.tx.us>.

Sincerely,


Administrative Law Judge

HDC/lg
cc: $\quad$ Stephen White, Assistant General Counsel, Texas Lottery Commission, 611 E. $6{ }^{\text {th }}$, Austin Texas 78701 - VIA E-MAIL Oxnoble, LLC, Agent, d/b/a Oxnoble Liquor, 3234 Fondren Rd., Houston, TX 77063 - VIA REGULAR MAIL

| TEXAS LOTTERY COMMISSION | $\S$ | BEFORE THE STATE OFFICE |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| LOTTERY OPERATIONS DIVISION, | $\S$ |  |
| Petitioner | $\S$ |  |
|  | $\S$ |  |
| v. | $\S$ |  |
|  | $\S$ | OF |
| OXNOBLE, LLC, AGENT | $\S$ |  |
| D/B/A OXNOBLE LIQUOR | $\S$ |  |
| SALES AGENT LICENSE NO. 153115, | $\S$ |  |
| $\quad$ Respondent | $\S$ | ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS |

## PROPOSAL FOR DECISION

The staff of the Texas Lottery Commission (Staff) seeks the revocation of a lottery sales agent's license held by Oxnoble, LLC, Agent d/b/a Oxnoble Liquor (Licensee) on the grounds that it failed to have sufficient funds available to cover electronic funds transfers to the account of the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). The Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) recommends revocation of the license.

On March 17, 2016, a hearing to consider Staff's allegations was conducted by ALJ Henry D. Card, at the State Office of Administrative Hearings, William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas. Staff appeared through Stephen White, Assistant General Counsel for the Commission. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing. After Staff established jurisdiction and notice as required by law, the hearing proceeded on a default basis. Therefore, the allegations and applicable law are discussed only in the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law below.

## I. FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Oxnoble, LLC, Agent $\mathrm{d} / \mathrm{b} / \mathrm{a}$ Oxnoble Liquor (Licensee), Houston, Texas, is a lottery sales agent licensed by the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). Licensee holds license number 153115.
2. On February 25, 2016, staff of the Commission sent a notice of hearing informing Licensee of the final hearing date, location of the hearing, and the allegations it intended to prove at the hearing; the notice was sent by certified mail, return receipt requested to Licensee's address as it appears in the Commission's records.
3. The notice of hearing advised Licensee in 12-point bold face type that failure to appear at the hearing would result in the factual allegations in the notice being admitted as true, and that the relief sought in the notice may be granted by default.
4. The hearing described in Finding of Fact No. 2 was held on March 17, 2016, in the William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas.
5. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing.
6. On the following dates Licensee failed to have sufficient funds available to cover an electronic transfer of funds to the Commission's account and owed the Commission the amounts listed below for the sale of lottery tickets:
(a) October 21, 2015, in the amount of $\$ 1,873.54$;
(b) December 30, 2015, in the amount of $\$ 510.85$;
(c) January 27, 2016, in the amount of $\$ 298.65$;
(d) February 3, 2016, in the amount of $\$ 1,168.89$; and
(e) February 3, 2016, in the amount of $\$ 683.75$.
7. The amounts described in Finding of Fact No. 6 were for the sale of lottery tickets less Licensee's commissions and credits for the amounts of cash prizes Licensee paid.

## II. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission) has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to the Texas Lottery Act (the Act), Tex. Gov't Code Ann. § 466.155.
2. The State Office of Administrative Hearings has jurisdiction over matters related to the hearing in this proceeding, including the authority to issue a proposal for decision with proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law, pursuant to Tex. Gov't Code Ann. ch. 2003.
3. Based upon Findings of Fact Nos. 2 and 3, proper and timely notice of the hearing was effected upon Licensee pursuant to the Administrative Procedure Act, Tex. Gov't Code Ann. $\S \S 2001.051-2001.052, \S 466.155(\mathrm{~b})$ of the Act, and 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 401.205(a)(4).
4. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 3 and 5, and Conclusion of Law No. 3, a default should be entered against Respondent pursuant to 1 Tex. Admin. Code § 155.501.
5. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 6 and 7, Licensee violated § 466.351 of the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 401.351 , which require the timely deposit of lottery ticket sales proceeds into a bank account to be held in trust for and owed to the Commission.
6. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 6 and 7, Licensee violated 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 401.352, which requires a licensee to have sufficient funds on deposit to cover electronic transfers of funds to the Commission.
7. Pursuant to the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code $\S \S 401.158$ and 401.352 , the Commission has authority to suspend or revoke a lottery sales agent's license for the violations described in the foregoing Conclusions of Law.
8. Based on the foregoing Conclusions of Law, the Commission is warranted in revoking Texas Lottery Sales Agent License Number 153115, issued to Oxnoble, LLC, Agent d/b/a Oxnoble Liquor of Houston, Texas.

SIGNED May 5, 2016.

-
-

# State Office of Administrative Hearings 



RECEIVED
2016 MAY -5 PM 2: 35
GENERAL COUNSEL
Lesli G. Ginn
Chief Administrative Law Judge
May 5, 2016

Gary Grief

VIA E-MAIL
Executive Director
Texas Lottery Commission
611 East 6th Street
Austin, Texas 78701
RE: Docket No. 362-16-2637; Texas Lottery Commission v. Raya Trading Inc., Agent, d/b/a Sunmart \#194, License No. 173479

Dear Mr. Grief:
Please find enclosed a Proposal for Decision in this case. It contains my recommendation and underlying rationale.

Exceptions and replies may be filed by any party in accordance with Texas Administrative Code title $1, \S 155.507$ (c), a SOAH rule found at <www.soah.state.tx.us>.

Sincerely,


HDC/lg
cc: $\quad$ Stephen White, Assistant General Counsel, Texas Lottery Commission, 611 E. $6^{\text {th }}$, Austin Texas 78701 - VIA E-MAIL Raya Trading Inc., Agent, d/b/a Sunmart \#194, 660 Sawdust Rd., Spring, TX 77380 - VIA REGULAR MAIL

300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Suite 502, Austin, Texas 78701/P.O. Box 13025, Austin, Texas 78711-3025
512.475.4993 (Main) 512.475.3445 (Docketing) 512.322.2061 (Fax)
www.soah.state.tx.us

## TEXAS LOTTERY COMMISSION <br> LOTTERY OPERATIONS DIVISION, Petitioner

v.

RAYA TRADING, INC., AGENT D/B/A SUNMART \#194
SALES AGENT LICENSE NO. 173479, Respondent

BEFORE THE STATE OFFICE

## OF

ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

## PROPOSAL FOR DECISION

The staff of the Texas Lottery Commission (Staff) seeks the revocation of a lottery sales agent's license held by Raya Trading, Inc., Agent d/b/a Sunmart \#194 (Licensee) on the grounds that it failed to have sufficient funds available to cover electronic funds transfers to the account of the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). The Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) recommends revocation of the license.

On March 17, 2016, a hearing to consider Staff's allegations was conducted by ALJ Henry D. Card, at the State Office of Administrative Hearings, William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas. Staff appeared through Stephen White, Assistant General Counsel for the Commission. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing. After Staff established jurisdiction and notice as required by law, the hearing proceeded on a default basis. Therefore, the allegations and applicable law are discussed only in the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law below.

## I. FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Raya Trading, Inc., Agent d/b/a Sunmart \#194 (Licensee), Spring, Texas, is a lottery sales agent licensed by the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). Licensee holds license number 173479.
2. On February 25, 2016, staff of the Commission sent a notice of hearing informing Licensee of the final hearing date, location of the hearing, and the allegations it intended to prove at the hearing; the notice was sent by certified mail, return receipt requested to Licensee's address as it appears in the Commission's records.
3. The notice of hearing advised Licensee in 12-point bold face type that failure to appear at the hearing would result in the factual allegations in the notice being admitted as true, and that the relief sought in the notice may be granted by default.
4. The hearing described in Finding of Fact No. 2 was held on March 17, 2016, in the William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas.
5. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing.
6. On January 21, 2016, Licensee failed to have sufficient funds in the amount of $\$ 5,576.87$ available to cover an electronic transfer of funds to the Commission's account and owed the Commission that amount for the sale of lottery tickets.
7. The amounts described in Finding of Fact No. 6 were for the sale of lottery tickets less Licensee's commissions and credits for the amounts of cash prizes Licensee paid.

## II. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission) has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to the Texas Lottery Act (the Act), Tex. Gov't Code Ann. § 466.155.
2. The State Office of Administrative Hearings has jurisdiction over matters related to the hearing in this proceeding, including the authority to issue a proposal for decision with proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law, pursuant to Tex. Gov't Code Ann. ch. 2003.
3. Based upon Findings of Fact Nos. 2 and 3, proper and timely notice of the hearing was effected upon Licensee pursuant to the Administrative Procedure Act, Tex. Gov't Code Ann. $\S \S 2001.051-2001.052, \S 466.155(\mathrm{~b})$ of the Act, and 16 Tex. Admin. Code § $401.205(\mathrm{a})(4)$.
4. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 3 and 5, and Conclusion of Law No. 3, a default should be entered against Respondent pursuant to 1 Tex. Admin. Code § 155.501.
5. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 6 and 7, Licensee violated $\S 466.351$ of the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 401.351, which require the timely deposit of lottery ticket sales proceeds into a bank account to be held in trust for and owed to the Commission.
6. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 6 and 7, Licensee violated 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 401.352, which requires a licensee to have sufficient funds on deposit to cover electronic transfers of funds to the Commission.
7. Pursuant to the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code $\S \S 401.158$ and 401.352, the Commission has authority to suspend or revoke a lottery sales agent's license for the violations described in the foregoing Conclusions of Law.
8. Based on the foregoing Conclusions of Law, the Commission is warranted in revoking Texas Lottery Sales Agent License Number 173479, issued to Raya Trading, Inc., Agent d/b/a Sunmart \#194 of Spring, Texas.

SIGNED May 5, 2016.


# State Office of Administrative Hearings 



Lesli G. Ginn
Chief Administrative Law Judge
May 5, 2016

Gary Grief
VIA E-MAIL
Executive Director
Texas Lottery Commission
611 East 6th Street
Austin, Texas 78701
RE: Docket No. 362-16-2638; Texas Lottery Commission v. D \& H Food Mart Inc., Agent, d/b/a, Bengel Mart, License No. 178078

Dear Mr. Grief:
Please find enclosed a Proposal for Decision in this case. It contains my recommendation and underlying rationale.

Exceptions and replies may be filed by any party in accordance with Texas Administrative Code title $1, \S 155.507$ (c), a SOAH rule found at <www.soah.state.tx.us>.

Sincerely,


HDC/Ig
cc: $\quad$ Stephen White, Assistant General Counsel, Texas Lottery Commission, 611 E. $6^{\text {th }}$, Austin Texas 78701 - VIA E-MAIL D \& H Food Mart Inc., Agent d/b/a Bengel Mart, 7915 Chatham Spring, Cypress, TX 77433 - VIA REGULAR MAIL

300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Suite 502, Austin, Texas 78701/ P.O. Box 13025, Austin, Texas 78711-3025 512.475.4993 (Main) 512.475.3445 (Docketing) 512.322.2061 (Fax)
www.soah.state.tx.us

| TEXAS LOTTERY COMMISSION | § | BEFORE THE STATE OFFICE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| LOTTERY OPERATIONS DIVISION, Petitioner | § |  |
|  | § |  |
|  | § |  |
| v. | § |  |
|  | $\S$ | OF |
| D \& H FOOD MART, INC., AGENT | § |  |
| D/B/A BENGAL MART | § |  |
| SALES AGENT LICENSE NO. 178078, | § |  |
| Respondent | § | ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS |

The staff of the Texas Lottery Commission (Staff) seeks the revocation of a lottery sales agent's license held by D \& H Food Mart, Inc., Agent d/b/a Bengal Mart (Licensee) on the grounds that it failed to have sufficient funds available to cover electronic funds transfers to the account of the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). The Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) recommends revocation of the license.

On March 17, 2016, a hearing to consider Staff's allegations was conducted by ALJ Henry D. Card, at the State Office of Administrative Hearings, William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas. Staff appeared through Stephen White, Assistant General Counsel for the Commission. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing. After Staff established jurisdiction and notice as required by law, the hearing proceeded on a default basis. Therefore, the allegations and applicable law are discussed only in the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law below.

## I. FINDINGS OF FACT

1. D \& H Food Mart, Inc., Agent d/b/a Bengal Mart (Licensee), Cypress, Texas, is a lottery sales agent licensed by the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). Licensee holds license number 178078.
2. On February 25, 2016, staff of the Commission sent a notice of hearing informing Licensee of the final hearing date, location of the hearing, and the allegations it intended to prove at the hearing; the notice was sent by certified mail, return receipt requested to Licensee's address as it appears in the Commission's records.
3. The notice of hearing advised Licensee in 12-point bold face type that failure to appear at the hearing would result in the factual allegations in the notice being admitted as true, and that the relief sought in the notice may be granted by default.
4. The hearing described in Finding of Fact No. 2 was held on March 17, 2016, in the William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas.
5. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing.
6. On the following dates Licensee failed to have sufficient funds available to cover an electronic transfer of funds to the Commission's account and owed the Commission the amounts listed below for the sale of lottery tickets:
(a) November 12, 2015, in the amount of $\$ 928.05$; and
(b) January 21, 2016, in the amount of $\$ 1,342.00$.
7. The amounts described in Finding of Fact No. 6 were for the sale of lottery tickets less Licensee's commissions and credits for the amounts of cash prizes Licensee paid.

## II. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission) has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to the Texas Lottery Act (the Act), Tex. Gov't Code Ann. § 466.155.
2. The State Office of Administrative Hearings has jurisdiction over matters related to the hearing in this proceeding, including the authority to issue a proposal for decision with proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law, pursuant to Tex. Gov't Code Ann. ch. 2003.
3. Based upon Findings of Fact Nos. 2 and 3, proper and timely notice of the hearing was effected upon Licensee pursuant to the Administrative Procedure Act, Tex. Gov't Code Ann. $\S \S 2001.051-2001.052, \S 466.155$ (b) of the Act, and 16 Tex. Admin. Code § $401.205(\mathrm{a})(4)$.
4. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 3 and 5, and Conclusion of Law No. 3, a default should be entered against Respondent pursuant to 1 Tex. Admin. Code § 155.501.
5. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 6 and 7, Licensee violated $\S 466.351$ of the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code $\S 401.351$, which require the timely deposit of lottery ticket sales proceeds into a bank account to be held in trust for and owed to the Commission.
6. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 6 and 7, Licensee violated 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 401.352, which requires a licensee to have sufficient funds on deposit to cover electronic transfers of funds to the Commission.
7. Pursuant to the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code $\S \S 401.158$ and 401.352 , the Commission has authority to suspend or revoke a lottery sales agent's license for the violations described in the foregoing Conclusions of Law.
8. Based on the foregoing Conclusions of Law, the Commission is warranted in revoking Texas Lottery Sales Agent License Number 178078, issued to D \& H Food Mart, Inc., Agent d/b/a Bengal Mart of Cypress, Texas.

SIGNED May 5, 2016.


# State Office of Administrative Hearings 



Lesli G. Ginn<br>Chief Administrative Law Judge

May 5, 2016

Gary Grief
VIA E-MAIL
Executive Director
Texas Lottery Commission
611 East 6th Street
Austin, Texas 78701
RE: Docket No. 362-16-2639; Texas Lottery Commission v. JB Super Stop Inc., Agent, d/b/a Tiger's Den, License No. 178370

## Dear Mr. Grief:

Please find enclosed a Proposal for Decision in this case. It contains my recommendation and underlying rationale.

Exceptions and replies may be filed by any party in accordance with Texas Administrative Code title 1, § 155.507(c), a SOAH rule found at <www.soah.state.tx.us>.

Sincerely,


HDC/lg
cc: $\quad$ Stephen White, Assistant General Counsel, Texas Lottery Commission, 611 E. $6^{\text {th }}$, Austin Texas 78701 - VIA E-MAIL JB Super Stop Inc., Agent, d/b/a Tiger's Den, 1108 Discovery St., Plano, TX 75094-4611-VIA REGULAR MAIL

300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Suite 502, Austin, Texas 78701/ P.O. Box 13025, Austin, Texas 78711-3025

| TEXAS LOTTERY COMMISSION | $\S$ | BEFORE THE STATE OFFICE |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| LOTTERY OPERATIONS DIVISION, | $\S$ |  |
| Petitioner | $\S$ |  |
|  | $\S$ |  |
| v. | $\S$ |  |
|  | $\S$ |  |
| JB SUPER STOP, INC. AGENT | $\S$ |  |
| D/B/A TIGER'S DEN | $\S$ |  |
| SALES AGENT LICENSE NO. 178370, | $\S$ |  |
| $\quad$ Respondent | $\S$ |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |

The staff of the Texas Lottery Commission (Staff) seeks the revocation of a lottery sales agent's license held by JB Super Stop, Inc., Agent d/b/a Tiger's Den (Licensee) on the grounds that it failed to have sufficient funds available to cover electronic funds transfers to the account of the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). The Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) recommends revocation of the license.

On March 17, 2016, a hearing to consider Staff's allegations was conducted by ALJ Henry D. Card, at the State Office of Administrative Hearings, William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas. Staff appeared through Stephen White, Assistant General Counsel for the Commission. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing. After Staff established jurisdiction and notice as required by law, the hearing proceeded on a default basis. Therefore, the allegations and applicable law are discussed only in the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law below.

## I. FINDINGS OF FACT

1. JB Super Stop, Inc., Agent d/b/a Tiger's Den (Licensee), Plano, Texas, is a lottery sales agent licensed by the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). Licensee holds license number 178370.
2. On February 25, 2016, staff of the Commission sent a notice of hearing informing Licensee of the final hearing date, location of the hearing, and the allegations it intended to prove at the hearing; the notice was sent by certified mail, return receipt requested to Licensee's address as it appears in the Commission's records.
3. The notice of hearing advised Licensee in 12-point bold face type that failure to appear at the hearing would result in the factual allegations in the notice being admitted as true, and that the relief sought in the notice may be granted by default.
4. The hearing described in Finding of Fact No. 2 was held on March 17, 2016, in the William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas.
5. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing.
6. On the following dates Licensee failed to have sufficient funds available to cover an electronic transfer of funds to the Commission's account and owed the Commission the amounts listed below for the sale of lottery tickets:
(a) June 3, 2015, in the amount of $\$ 1,153.97$;
(b) June 24, 2015, in the amount of $\$ 3,847.20$;
(c) November 18, 2015, in the amount of $\$ 3,082.10$;
(d) January 21, 2016, in the amount of $\$ 7,954.45$; and
(e) January 27, 2016, in the amount of $\$ \mathbf{2}, 085.42$.
7. The amounts described in Finding of Fact No. 6 were for the sale of lottery tickets less Licensee's commissions and credits for the amounts of cash prizes Licensee paid.

## II. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission) has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to the Texas Lottery Act (the Act), Tex. Gov't Code Ann. § 466.155.
2. The State Office of Administrative Hearings has jurisdiction over matters related to the hearing in this proceeding, including the authority to issue a proposal for decision with proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law, pursuant to Tex. Gov't Code Ann. ch. 2003.
3. Based upon Findings of Fact Nos. 2 and 3, proper and timely notice of the hearing was effected upon Licensee pursuant to the Administrative Procedure Act, Tex. Gov't Code Ann. $\S \S 2001.051-2001.052, \S 466.155(\mathrm{~b})$ of the Act, and 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 401.205(a)(4).
4. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 3 and 5, and Conclusion of Law No. 3, a default should be entered against Respondent pursuant to 1 Tex. Admin. Code § 155.501.
5. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 6 and 7, Licensee violated § 466.351 of the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code $\S 401.351$, which require the timely deposit of lottery ticket sales proceeds into a bank account to be held in trust for and owed to the Commission.
6. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 6 and 7, Licensee violated 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 401.352, which requires a licensee to have sufficient funds on deposit to cover electronic transfers of funds to the Commission.
7. Pursuant to the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code $\S \S 401.158$ and 401.352 , the Commission has authority to suspend or revoke a lottery sales agent's license for the violations described in the foregoing Conclusions of Law.
8. Based on the foregoing Conclusions of Law, the Commission is warranted in revoking Texas Lottery Sales Agent License Number 178370, issued to JB Super Stop, Inc., Agent d/b/a Tiger's Den of Plano, Texas.

SIGNED May 5, 2016.


# State Office of Administrative Hearings 



Lesli G. Ginn<br>Chief Administrative Law Judge

May 5, 2016

Gary Grief<br>VIA E-MAIL<br>Executive Director<br>Texas Lottery Commission<br>611 East 6th Street<br>Austin, Texas 78701

RE: Docket No. 362-16-2640; Texas Lottery Commission v. Campos Guerrero LLC, Agent, d/b/a Campos Meat Market, License No. 178486

Dear Mr. Grief:
Please find enclosed a Proposal for Decision in this case. It contains my recommendation and underlying rationale.

Exceptions and replies may be filed by any party in accordance with Texas Administrative Code title $1, \S 155.507$ (c), a SOAH rule found at <www.soah.state.tx.us>.

Sincerely,


Administrative Law Judge

HDC/lg
cc: $\quad$ Stephen White, Assistant General Counsel, Texas Lottery Commission, 611 E. $6^{\text {th }}$, Austin Texas 78701 - VIA E-MAIL Campos Guerrero LLC, Agent, d/b/a Campos Meat Market, 14045 FM 2100 RD, Suite 170, Crosby, TX 77532-6669 VIA REGULAR MAIL

300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Suite 502, Austin, Texas 78701/ P.O. Box 13025, Austin, Texas 78711-3025

| TEXAS LOTTERY COMMISSION | $\S$ | BEFORE THE STATE OFFICE |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| LOTTERY OPERATIONS DIVISION, | $\S$ |  |
| Petitioner | $\S$ |  |
|  | $\S$ |  |
| v. | $\S$ |  |
|  | $\S$ |  |
| CAMPOS GUERRERO, LLC, AGENT | $\S$ |  |
| D/B/A CAMPOS MEAT MARKET | $\S$ |  |
| SALES AGENT LICENSE NO. 178486, | $\S$ |  |
| $\quad$ Respondent | $\S$ | ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS |

## PROPOSAL FOR DECISION

The staff of the Texas Lottery Commission (Staff) seeks the revocation of a lottery sales agent's license held by Campos Guerrero, LLC, Agent d/b/a Campos Meat Market (Licensee) on the grounds that it failed to have sufficient funds available to cover electronic funds transfers to the account of the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). The Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) recommends revocation of the license.

On March 17, 2016, a hearing to consider Staff's allegations was conducted by ALJ Henry D. Card, at the State Office of Administrative Hearings, William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas. Staff appeared through Stephen White, Assistant General Counsel for the Commission. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing. After Staff established jurisdiction and notice as required by law, the hearing proceeded on a default basis. Therefore, the allegations and applicable law are discussed only in the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law below.

## I. FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Campos Guerrero, LLC, Agent $\mathrm{d} / \mathrm{b} / \mathrm{a}$ Campos Meat Market (Licensee), Crosby, Texas, is a lottery sales agent licensed by the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). Licensee holds license number 178486.
2. On February 25, 2016, staff of the Commission sent a notice of hearing informing Licensee of the final hearing date, location of the hearing, and the allegations it intended to prove at the hearing; the notice was sent by certified mail, return receipt requested to Licensee's address as it appears in the Commission's records.
3. The notice of hearing advised Licensee in 12-point bold face type that failure to appear at the hearing would result in the factual allegations in the notice being admitted as true, and that the relief sought in the notice may be granted by default.
4. The hearing described in Finding of Fact No. 2 was held on March 17, 2016, in the William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas.
5. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing.
6. On the following dates Licensee failed to have sufficient funds available to cover an electronic transfer of funds to the Commission's account and owed the Commission the amounts listed below for the sale of lottery tickets:
(a) July 29,2015 , in the amount of $\$ 214.65$;
(b) August 12, 2015, in the amount of $\$ 2.75$;
(c) September 16, 2015, in the amount of \$342.90; and
(b) January 21, 2016, in the amount of $\$ 669.00$.
7. The amounts described in Finding of Fact No. 6 were for the sale of lottery tickets less Licensee's commissions and credits for the amounts of cash prizes Licensee paid.

## II. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission) has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to the Texas Lottery Act (the Act), Tex. Gov't Code Ann. § 466.155.
2. The State Office of Administrative Hearings has jurisdiction over matters related to the hearing in this proceeding, including the authority to issue a proposal for decision with proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law, pursuant to Tex. Gov't Code Ann. ch. 2003.
3. Based upon Findings of Fact Nos. 2 and 3, proper and timely notice of the hearing was effected upon Licensee pursuant to the Administrative Procedure Act, Tex. Gov't Code Ann. $\S \S 2001.051-2001.052, \S 466.155(\mathrm{~b})$ of the Act, and 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 401.205(a)(4).
4. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 3 and 5, and Conclusion of Law No. 3, a default should be entered against Respondent pursuant to 1 Tex. Admin. Code § 155.501.
5. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 6 and 7, Licensee violated § 466.351 of the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 401.351, which require the timely deposit of lottery ticket sales proceeds into a bank account to be held in trust for and owed to the Commission.
6. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 6 and 7, Licensee violated 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 401.352, which requires a licensee to have sufficient funds on deposit to cover electronic transfers of funds to the Commission.
7. Pursuant to the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code $\S \S 401.158$ and 401.352 , the Commission has authority to suspend or revoke a lottery sales agent's license for the violations described in the foregoing Conclusions of Law.
8. Based on the foregoing Conclusions of Law, the Commission is warranted in revoking Texas Lottery Sales Agent License Number 178486, issued to Campos Guerrero, LLC, Agent d/b/a Campos Meat Market of Crosby, Texas.

SIGNED May 5, 2016.


# State Office of Administrative Hearings 



RECEIVED<br>2016MAY-5 PM 2:35<br>blen sehtuos GENERAL COUNSEL

Lesli G. Ginn<br>Chief Administrative Law Judge

May 5, 2016

Gary Grief
VIA E-MAIL
Executive Director
Texas Lottery Commission
611 East 6th Street
Austin, Texas 78701
RE: Docket No. 362-16-2641; Texas Lottery Commission v. First Interactive Inc., Agent, d/b/a I-35 Texaco, License No. 180073

Dear Mr. Grief:
Please find enclosed a Proposal for Decision in this case. It contains my recommendation and underlying rationale.

Exceptions and replies may be filed by any party in accordance with Texas Administrative Code title $1, \S 155.507$ (c), a SOAH rule found at <www.soah.state.tx.us>.

Sincerely,


Henry D. Card
Administrative Law Judge

HDC/Ig
cc: $\quad$ Stephen White, Assistant General Counsel, Texas Lottery Commission, 611 E. $6^{\text {th }}$, Austin Texas 78701 - VIA E-MAIL First Interactive Inc., Agent, d/b/a I-35 Texaco, 6005 SRL Thornton Freeway, Dallas, TX 75232 - VIA REGULAR MAIL


PROPOSAL FOR DECISION

The staff of the Texas Lottery Commission (Staff) seeks the revocation of a lottery sales agent's license held by First Interactive, Inc., Agent d/b/a I 35 Texaco (Licensee) on the grounds that it failed to have sufficient funds available to cover electronic funds transfers to the account of the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). The Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) recommends revocation of the license.

On March 17, 2016, a hearing to consider Staff's allegations was conducted by ALJ Henry D. Card, at the State Office of Administrative Hearings, William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas. Staff appeared through Stephen White, Assistant General Counsel for the Commission. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing. After Staff established jurisdiction and notice as required by law, the hearing proceeded on a default basis. Therefore, the allegations and applicable law are discussed only in the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law below.

## I. FINDINGS OF FACT

1. First Interactive, Inc., Agent d/b/a I 35 Texaco (Licensee), Dallas, Texas, is a lottery sales agent licensed by the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). Licensee holds license number 180073.
2. On February 25, 2016, staff of the Commission sent a notice of hearing informing Licensee of the final hearing date, location of the hearing, and the allegations it intended to prove at the hearing; the notice was sent by certified mail, return receipt requested to Licensee's address as it appears in the Commission's records.
3. The notice of hearing advised Licensee in 12-point bold face type that failure to appear at the hearing would result in the factual allegations in the notice being admitted as true, and that the relief sought in the notice may be granted by default.
4. The hearing described in Finding of Fact No. 2 was held on March 17, 2016, in the William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas.
5. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing.
6. On January 21, 2016, Licensee failed to have sufficient funds in the amount of $\$ \mathbf{3}, \mathbf{4 2 9 . 3 0}$ available to cover an electronic transfer of funds to the Commission's account and owed the Commission that amount for the sale of lottery tickets.
7. The amounts described in Finding of Fact No. 6 were for the sale of lottery tickets less Licensee's commissions and credits for the amounts of cash prizes Licensee paid.

## II. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission) has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to the Texas Lottery Act (the Act), Tex. Gov't Code Ann. § 466.155.
2. The State Office of Administrative Hearings has jurisdiction over matters related to the hearing in this proceeding, including the authority to issue a proposal for decision with proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law, pursuant to Tex. Gov't Code Ann. ch. 2003.
3. Based upon Findings of Fact Nos. 2 and 3, proper and timely notice of the hearing was effected upon Licensee pursuant to the Administrative Procedure Act, Tex. Gov't Code Ann. $\S \S 2001.051-2001.052, \S 466.155$ (b) of the Act, and 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 401.205(a)(4).
4. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 3 and 5, and Conclusion of Law No. 3, a default should be entered against Respondent pursuant to 1 Tex. Admin. Code § 155.501.
5. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 6 and 7, Licensee violated $\S 466.351$ of the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code $\S 401.351$, which require the timely deposit of lottery ticket sales proceeds into a bank account to be held in trust for and owed to the Commission.
6. Based on Findings of Fact Nos. 6 and 7, Licensee violated 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 401.352, which requires a licensee to have sufficient funds on deposit to cover electronic transfers of funds to the Commission.
7. Pursuant to the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code $\S \S 401.158$ and 401.352 , the Commission has authority to suspend or revoke a lottery sales agent's license for the violations described in the foregoing Conclusions of Law.
8. Based on the foregoing Conclusions of Law, the Commission is warranted in revoking Texas Lottery Sales Agent License Number 180073, issued to First Interactive, Inc., Agent d/b/a I 35 Texaco of Dallas, Texas.

SIGNED May 5, 2016.


# State Office of Administrative Hearings <br>  

Lesli G. Ginn
Chief Administrative Law Judge

May 16, 2016

Gary Grief
VIA E-MAIL
Executive Director
Texas Lottery Commission
611 East 6th Street
Austin, Texas 78701
RE: Docket No. 362-16-3265; Texas Lottery Commission v. Keyaan Enterprise Inc., Agent, d/b/a La Viva Grocery, License No. 178381

Dear Mr. Grief:
Please find enclosed a Proposal for Decision in this case. It contains my recommendation and underlying rationale.

Exceptions and replies may be filed by any party in accordance with Texas Administrative Code title $1, \S 155.507$ (c), a SOAH rule found at <www.soah.state.tx.us>.


GWE/ls
cc: Kristen Guthrie, Assistant General Counsel, Texas Lottery Commission, 611 E. $6^{\text {th }}$, Austin Texas 78701 - VIA EMAIL
Keyaan Enterprise Inc., 1307 Kyle Hill Lane, Sugar Land, TX 77479 -VIA REGULAR MAIL


## BEFORE THE STATE OFFICE

## OF

## ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

## PROPOSAL FOR DECISION

The staff of the Texas Lottery Commission (Staff) seeks the revocation of a lottery sales agent's license held by Keyaan Enterprise, Inc., Agent d/b/a La Viva Grocery (Licensee) on the grounds that it failed to have sufficient funds available to cover electronic funds transfers to the account of the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). The Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) recommends revocation of the license.

On April 14, 2016, a hearing to consider Staff's allegations was conducted by ALJ Gary W. Elkins, at the State Office of Administrative Hearings, William P. Clements Building, $300 \mathrm{~W} .15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas. Staff appeared through Kristen Guthrie, Assistant General Counsel for the Commission. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing. After Staff established jurisdiction and notice as required by law, the hearing proceeded on a default basis. Therefore, the allegations and applicable law are discussed only in the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law below.

## I. FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Keyaan Enterprise, Inc., Agent d/b/a La Viva Grocery (Licensee), Sugar Land, Texas, is a lottery sales agent licensed by the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). Licensee holds license number 178381.
2. On March 24, 2016, staff of the Commission sent notice of hearing informing Licensee of the final hearing date, location of the hearing, and the allegations it intended to prove at the hearing; the notice was sent by certified mail, return receipt requested to Licensee's address
as it appears in the Commission's records.
3. The notice of hearing advised Licensee in 12-point bold face type that failure to appear at the hearing would result in the factual allegations in the notice being admitted as true, and that the relief sought in the notice may be granted by default.
4. The hearing described in Finding of Fact No. 2 was held on April 14, 2016, in the William P. Clements Building, 300 W. $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Fourth Floor, Austin, Texas.
5. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing.
6. On the following dates Licensee failed to have sufficient funds available to cover an electronic transfer of funds to the Commission's account and owed the Commission the amounts listed below for the sale of lottery tickets:
(a) December 16, 2015, in the amount of $\$ 187.00$; and
(b) February 18, 2016, in the amount of $\$ \mathbf{3 2 0 . 6 0}$.
7. The amounts described in Finding of Fact No. 6 were for the sale of lottery tickets less Licensee's commissions and credits for the amounts of cash prizes Licensee paid.

## II. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission) has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to the Texas Lottery Act (the Act), Tex. Gov't Code Ann. § 466.155.
2. The State Office of Administrative Hearings has jurisdiction over matters related to the hearing in this proceeding, including the authority to issue a proposal for decision with proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law, pursuant to Tex. Gov't Code Ann. ch. 2003.
3. Proper and timely notice of the hearing was effected upon Licensee pursuant to the Administrative Procedure Act, Tex. Gov't Code Ann. §§ 2001.051-2001.052, § 466.155(b) of the Act, and 16 Tex. Admin. Code § $401.205(\mathrm{a})(4)$.
4. A default should be entered against Respondent pursuant to 1 Tex. Admin. Code § 155.501.
5. Licensee violated $\S 466.351$ of the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code $\S 401.351$, which require the timely deposit of lottery ticket sales proceeds into a bank account to be held in trust for and owed to the Commission.
6. Licensee violated 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 401.352, which requires a licensee to have sufficient funds on deposit to cover electronic transfers of funds to the Commission.
7. Pursuant to the Act and 16 Tex. Admin. Code $\S \S 401.158$ and 401.352 , the Commission has authority to suspend or revoke a lottery sales agent's license for the violations described in the foregoing Conclusions of Law.
8. The Commission is warranted in revoking Texas Lottery Sales Agent License Number 178381, issued to Keyaan Enterprise, Inc., Agent d/b/a La Viva Grocery of Sugar Land, Texas.

SIGNED May 16, 2016.


# State Office of Administrative Hearings 



Z C CIMED
2016 MAY II PH 2:39
amaral cuuncel
Lesli G. Gimm
Chief Administrative Law Judge

May 11, 2016
Gary Grief
VIA E-MAIL Executive Director
Texas Lottery Commission
611 East 6th Street
Austin, Texas 78701
RE: Docket No. 362-16-3590; Texas Lottery Commission v. GSA C-Stores Inc., Agent, d/b/a Saving Food Store; License No. 151465

Dear Mr. Grief:
Please find enclosed a Proposal for Decision in this case. It contains my recommendation and underlying rationale.

Exceptions and replies may be filed by any party in accordance with Texas Administrative Code title 1, § 155.507 (c), a SOAH rule found at <www.soah.state.tx.us>.

Sincerely,


HDC/lg
cc: Kristen Guthrie, Assistant General Counsel, Texas Lottery Commission, 611 E. $6^{\text {th }}$, Austin Texas 78701 - VIA EMAIL
Respondent Agent, address, zip -VIA REGULAR MAIL

300 W. 15 th Street, Suite 504, Austin, Texas 78701/ P.O. Box 13025, Austin, Texas 78711-3025 512.475.4993 (Main) 512.475.3445 (Docketing) 512.475.4994 (Fax)
www.soah.texas.gov

## SOAH DOCKET NO. 362-16-3590

TEXAS LOTTERY COMMISSION

## v.

GSA C-STORES, INC., AGENT D/B/A SAVING FOOD STORE SALES AGENT LICENSE NO. 151465
§ ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

## PROPOSAL FOR DECISION

The staff of the Texas Lottery Commission (Staff) requested the revocation of a lottery sales agent's license held by GSA C-Stores, Inc., Agent d/b/a Saving Food Store (Licensee) on the grounds that Licensee failed to have sufficient funds available to cover electronic funds transfers to the account of the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). The Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) recommends revocation of the license.

On April 28, 2016, in Austin, Texas, ALJ Henry Card conducted a hearing to consider Staff's allegations. Kristen Guthrie, Assistant General Counsel, represented the Commission. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing. After Staff established jurisdiction and notice, the hearing proceeded on a default basis. Therefore, the allegations and applicable law are discussed only in the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law below.

## I. FINDINGS OF FACT

1. GSA C-Stores, Inc., Agent d/b/a Saving Food Store (Licensee), Houston, Texas, is a lottery sales agent licensed by the Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission). Licensee holds license number 151465.
2. On April 7, 2016, staff of the Commission (Staff) sent notice of hearing informing Licensee of the final hearing date, location of the hearing, and the allegations it intended to prove at the hearing. The notice was sent by certified mail, return receipt requested, to Licensee's address as it appears in the Commission's records.
3. The notice of hearing informed Licensee in 12-point, bold face type that failure to appear at the hearing would result in the factual allegations in the notice of hearing being admitted as true, and that the relief sought in the notice may be granted by default.
4. The hearing described in Finding of Fact No. 2 was held on April 28, 2016, at the State Office of Administrative Hearings, located in the William P. Clements Building at 300 West $15^{\text {th }}$ Street, Austin, Texas.
5. Licensee did not appear and was not represented at the hearing.
6. On March 2, 2016, Licensee failed to have sufficient funds available to cover an electronic transfer of funds to the Commission's account and owed the Commission $\$ 792.54$ for the sale of lottery tickets.

## II. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Texas Lottery Commission (the Commission) has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to the Texas Lottery Act (the Act), Texas Government Code $\S 466.155$.
2. The State Office of Administrative Hearings has jurisdiction over matters related to the hearing in this proceeding, including the authority to issue a Proposal for Decision with proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, as provided by Texas Government Code Chapter 2003.
3. Proper and timely notice of the hearing was effected upon Licensee pursuant to the Administrative Procedure Act, Texas Government Code §§ 2001.051-2001.052; $\S 466.155(\mathrm{~b})$ of the Act; and 16 Texas Administrative Code $\S 401.205(4)$.
4. A default should be entered against Licensee, pursuant to 1 Texas Administrative Code § 155.501.
5. Licensee violated § 466.351 of the Act and 16 Texas Administrative Code § 401.351, which require the timely deposit of lottery ticket sales proceeds into a bank account to be held in trust for and owed to the Commission.
6. Licensee violated 16 Texas Administrative Code $\S 401.352$, which requires a licensee to have sufficient funds on deposit to cover electronic transfers of funds to the Commission.
7. Pursuant to $\S 466.155$ of the Act and 16 Texas Administrative Code $\S \S 401.158$ and 401.352(a), the Commission has authority to suspend or revoke a lottery sales agent's license for the violations described in the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law.
8. The Commission is warranted in revoking Texas Lottery Sales Agent License No. 151465, issued to GSA C-Stores, Inc., Agent d/b/a Saving Food Store of Houston, Texas.

SIGNED May 11, 2016.


## Commission Order No. 16-0042

Date: JULY 11, 2016

DOCKET NO. 362-16-0981.B

| TEXAS LOTTERY COMMISSION | $\S$ | BEFORE THE TEXAS |
| :--- | :---: | :--- |
| PETITIONER | $\S$ |  |
|  | $\S$ |  |
| VS. | $\S$ |  |
|  | $\S$ |  |
| CAMILLE BERMEJO | $\S$ | LOTTERY COMMISSION |
| RESPONDENT | $\S$ |  |
|  |  |  |
|  | ORDER OF THE COMMISSION |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  | TO: |

During open meeting at Austin, Texas, the Texas Lottery Commission finds that, after proper and timely notice was given, the above-styled case was heard by an Administrative Law Judge who made and filed a Proposal for Decision containing the Administrative Law Judge's Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law. The Proposal for Decision was properly served and all parties were given an opportunity to file exceptions and replies as part of the record herein.

The Texas Lottery Commission, after review and due consideration of the Proposal for Decision, and exceptions and replies filed, if any, adopts the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law of the Administrative Law Judge as if fully set out and separately stated herein. All proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law not specifically adopted herein are hereby denied.

## Commission Order No. 16-0042

## Date: JULY 11, 2016

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED that the Respondent's renewal application for inclusion on the Registry is denied and her name should be removed from the Registry of Approved Bingo Workers.

Passed and approved at the regular meeting of the Texas Lottery Commission at Austin, Texas, on the $\underline{11^{\mathrm{TH}}}$ day of JULY. 2016.

Entered this $11^{\mathrm{TH}}$ day of JULY, 2016.
J. WINSTON KRAUSE, CHAIRMAN

CARMEN ARRIETA-CANDELARIA, COMMISSIONER

PEGGY A. HEEG, COMMISSIONER

DOUG LOWE, COMMISSIONER

ROBERT RIVERA, COMMISSIONER

# State Office of Administrative Hearings 



# Cathleen Parsley Chief Administrative Law Judge 

March 22, 2016

Gary Grief
Executive Director
Texas Lottery Commission
611 East 6th Street
Austin, Texas 78701
VIA E-MAIL

## RE: Docket No. 362-16-0981.B; Texas Lottery Commission v. Camille Bermejo

Dear Mr. Grief:
Please find enclosed a Proposal for Decision in this case. It contains my recommendation and underlying rationale.

Exceptions and replies may be filed by any party in accordance with Texas Administrative Code title $1, \S 155.507$ (c), a SOAH rule found at <www.soah.state.tx.us>.


Stephen White, Assistant General Counsel, Texas Lottery Commission, $611 \mathrm{~F} 6^{\text {th }}$ Austin Texas 78701 D Camille Bermejo, 3131 Gordon Avenue, Fort Worth, TX 76110-3708-VIA REGULAR MAII 701 - VIA E-MAIL
$300 \mathrm{~W} .15^{\text {h }}$ Street, Suite 502, Austin, Texas 78701/P.O. Box 13025, Austin, Texas 78711-3025 512.475.4993 (Main) 512.475.3445 (Docketing) 512.322.2061 (Fax)
www.soah.state.tx.us

## SOAH DOCKET NO. 362-16-0981.B


#### Abstract

TEXAS LOTTERY COMMISSION, Petitioner V.

\section*{CAMILLE BERMEJO,} Respondent

\section*{PROPOSAL FOR DECISION}

The staff (Staff) of the Texas Lottery Commission (Commission) seeks to remove Camille Bermejo (Respondent) from the Commission's Registry of Approved Bingo Workers (Registry) because Respondent pleaded guilty to the offense of aggravated assault with a deadly weapon, for which she was sentenced to deferred adjudication with community supervision for a period of 6 years. The Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) recommends that the Commission remove Respondent's name from the Registry.


## I. JURISDICTION AND NOTICE

Neither jurisdiction nor notice was disputed, and they are addressed in the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law.

## II. PROCEDURAL HISTORY

On November 10, 2016, Staff issued a notice of hearing informing Respondent that a hearing would be convened to consider allegations that she violated the Bingo Enabling Act.

The hearing convened and closed on January 25, 2016, before the State Office of Administrative Hearings (SOAH) in Austin, Texas. ALJ Gary W. Elkins presided. Staff was represented by Stephen White, Assistant General Counsel for the Commission. Respondent did not appear at the hearing. After evidence of notice and jurisdiction was taken, Staff moved for a default pursuant to 1 Texas Administrative Code § 155.501 based on Respondent's failure to appear. The ALJ granted the motion, and the allegations were deemed admitted.

## III. FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Camille Bermejo (Respondent) is on the Registry of Approved Bingo Workers (Registry).
2. On January 21, 2015, Respondent signed and submitted to the Commission a renewal application for the purpose of remaining on the Registry.
3. The Charitable Bingo Operations Division of the Texas Lottery Commission (Commission) opposes Respondent's application and seeks to remove her from the Registry.
4. On September 21, 2015, the Commission's staff (Staff) sent Respondent a notice of the Commission's intent to remove her from the Registry based on her plea of guilty to the criminal offense of Aggravated Assault with a Deadly Weapon, a second degree felony, and her placement on community supervision for a period of 6 years. The notice was sent to Respondent at her last known address as shown in the Commission's records: 3131 Gordon Ave., Fort Worth, Texas 76110, by both United States first class mail and certified mail, return receipt requested. The notice was delivered to Respondent on September 24, 2015.
5. On November 10, 2015, Staff sent Respondent a Notice of Hearing via United States first class mail and by certified mail, return receipt requested, to her address reflected in Finding of Fact No. 4. The notice contained a statement of the time, place, and nature of the hearing, a statement of matters asserted, and a statement of the legal authority and jurisdiction under which the hearing was to be held. The Notice of Hearing also informed Respondent that her failure to appear at the hearing could result in the allegations set forth in the Notice of Hearing being deemed admitted and the relief sought by Staff being granted by default.
6. The hearing convened on January 25, 2016, before the State Office of Administrative Hearings (SOAH), with Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) Gary W. Elkins presiding.
7. Staff appeared at the hearing and was represented by Stephen White, Assistant General Counsel. Respondent did not appear. Based on Respondent's failure to appear, the hearing proceeded on a default basis, and the hearing closed the same day.
8. On September 4, 2013, in Cause No. 1314186D before the $371^{\text {st }}$ District Court of Tarrant County, Texas, Respondent pleaded guilty to the second degree felony offense of Aggravated Assault with a Deadly Weapon. Respondent received deferred adjudication and was placed on mandatory community supervision for a period of 6 years.
9. Respondent has not completed her period of community supervision.

## IV. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Commission has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to the Bingo Enabling Act (the Act), Texas Occupations Code $\S \S 2001.051$ and .353 ; Texas Government Code § 467.101.
2. SOAH has jurisdiction over matters related to the hearing in this proceeding, including the authority to issue a proposal for decision with findings of fact and conclusions of law, pursuant to Texas Government Code ch. 2003.
3. Proper and timely notice of the hearing was effected upon Respondent. Tex. Gov't Code ch. 2001.
4. The allegations in the Commission's Notice of Hearing were deemed admitted based on Respondent's failure to appear at the hearing. 1 Tex. Admin. Code § 155.501.
5. A registrant on the Registry is a licensee within the meaning of 16 Texas Administrative Code § 401.227(6) and is therefore subject to the provisions of Texas Occupations Code § 2001.554.
6. Pursuant to Texas Occupations Code $\S 53.021(\mathrm{~d})(1)(\mathrm{B})(\mathrm{i})$, a licensing authority may consider a person to have been convicted of an offense, regardless of whether the proceedings were dismissed and the person was discharged, if the person has not completed the period of community supervision or the person completed the period of supervision less than 5 years before the date the person applied for the license.
7. Respondent's renewal application for inclusion on the Registry should be denied, and her name should be removed from the Registry.

SIGNED March 22, 2016.


Commission Order No. 16-0043

## Date: JULY 11, 2016

DOCKET NO. 362-15-5571.B

| TEXAS LOTTERY COMMISSION | $\S$ | BEFORE THE TEXAS |
| :--- | :---: | :--- |
| PETITIONER | $\S$ |  |
|  | $\S$ |  |
| VS. | $\S$ |  |
|  | $\S$ |  |
| HABITABLE SPACES | $\S$ |  |
| APPLICANT | $\S$ | LOTTERY COMMISSION |

## ORDER OF THE COMMISSION

TO: Mr. Christopher Heinemeier
Habitable Spaces
3050 FM 1104
Kingsbury, TX 78638-2533
Mr. Eddie Heinemeier
3239-1 Rustic Oak
San Antonio, TX 78261

During open meeting at Austin, Texas, the Texas Lottery Commission finds that, after proper and timely notice was given, the above-styled case was heard by an Administrative Law Judge who made and filed a Proposal for Decision containing the Administrative Law Judge's Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law. The Proposal for Decision was properly served and all parties were given an opportunity to file exceptions and replies as part of the record herein.

The Texas Lottery Commission, after review and due consideration of the Proposal for Decision, and exceptions and replies filed, if any, adopts the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law of the Administrative Law Judge as if fully set out and separately stated herein. All proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law not specifically adopted herein are hereby denied.

Commission Order No. 16-0043

## Date: JULY 11, 2016

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED that the Habitable Spaces's application should be denied.

Passed and approved at the regular meeting of the Texas Lottery Commission at Austin, Texas, on the $11^{\mathrm{TH}}$ day of JULY, 2016.

Entered this $\underline{11^{\text {TH }}}$ day of JULY, 2016.
J. WINSTON KRAUSE, CHAIRMAN

CARMEN ARRIETA-CANDELARIA, COMMISSIONER

PEGGY A. HEEG, COMMISSIONER

DOUG LOWE, COMMISSIONER

ROBERT RIVERA, COMMISSIONER

## CASE SUMMARY

## PARTY NAME: DOCKET NO./CASE NAME:

Texas Lottery Commission Staff

362-15-5571.B; Habitable Spaces

## ISSUE(S):

1.) Did the Bingo Division properly deny the Application because Applicant did not have 501(c) taxexempt status for three years prior to its application date?
2.) Did the Bingo Division properly deny the Application because Applicant failed to show it has been organized as a fraternal organization in Texas for at least three years with a bona fide membership that was actively and continuously engaged in furthering its charitable purpose?

## KEY FACTS:

The SOAH Judge found at least two independent reasons for denial of the application. First, the SOAH Judge determined an organization can only meet the three-year eligibility requirement as a fraternal organization if it has been a nonprofit organization having 501(c) tax-exempt status for at least three years. It is undisputed that Applicant did not have tax-exempt status from the IRS until March of 2014. Because the Applicant did not have the 501(c) tax-exempt status for at least three years prior, the application was denied. Second, the SOAH Judge determined that the Applicant failed to show it has been organized as a fraternal organization in Texas for at least three years with a bona fide membership that was actively and continuously engaged in furthering its charitable purpose. Applicant did not file its Certificate of Formation with the Secretary of State's Office until March 2014, and did not have voting members until March 2015.

## LEGAL PRINCIPLES INVOLVED:

TEX. OCC. CODE ANN. § 2001.002(11) defines "fraternal organization" as: "A nonprofit organization organized to perform and engaged primarily in performing charitable, benevolent, patriotic, employment-related, or educational functions that meet the other requirements of this chapter." (emphasis added)
TEx. Occ. Code AnN. § 2001.002(19) defines "nonprofit organization" as: "An unincorporated association or a corporation that is incorporated or holds a certificate of authority under the Texas Non-Profit Corporation Act (Article 1396-1.01 et seq., Vernon's Texas Civil Statutes). The organization:
(A) may not distribute any of its income to its members, officers, or governing body, other than as reasonable compensation for services; and
(B) must have obtained tax exempt status under Section 501(c), Internal Revenue Code of 1986." (emphasis added)
TEX. Occ. Code AnN. § 2001.101(b)(1) and (2) state, in part: "(b) A fraternal organization:
(1) must have been organized in this state for at least three years;
(2) must have had during the three year period a bona fide membership actively and continuously engaged as an organization in furthering its charitable purposes." (emphasis added)

ACTION REQUESTED: Approve the Proposal for Decision and deny Applicant's original license application.

## CASE SUMMARY

## PARTY NAME/STATUS: Habitable Spaces

DOCKET NO./CASE NAME: 362-15-5571.B: Habitable Spaces

ISSUE(S):
The license was denied for two reasons:

1. The Bingo Division alleged that Habitable Spaces did not have tax exempt status for 3 consecutive years preceding the filing of the application
2. The Bingo Division alleged that Habitable wasn't organized for at least 3 years and didn't have a membership for those 3 years.

## KEY FACTS:

The Bingo Division has issued licenses in instances where the organization didn't have tax exempt status for a 3 year period and Habitable Spaces tried to have witnesses testify to that fact. But, the AL wouldn't let Habitable Spaces because Habitable Spaces didn't disclose them as expert witnesses. Habitable Spaces is requesting the Commission remand the case back to SOAH so two witnesses, Stephen Fenoglio and Phil Sanderson can testify as to the Commission's long standing interpretation. Habitable Spaces was organized in Texas for at least 3 years and did have a membership. Habitable Spaces whether incorporated or in the form it was in prior to incorporation was still organized to perform its charitable mission for at least 3 years before and did have an active membership.

LEGAL PRINCIPLES INVOLVED: Bingo Enabling Act Section 2001.002(11) \& (19). Rule 402.420 (This rule does not require three years)

ACTION REQUESTED: Habitable Spaces is requesting to have the Commission remand the case back to SOAH so Habitable Spaces can have Stephen Fenoglio and Phil Sanderson testify as to the Commission's interpretation. Habitable Spaces did not have an attorney at the hearing since they could not afford it and Habitable Spaces didn't know that these two witnesses, testimony would be "expert" versus "fact". Habitable Spaces did disclose both of them as people with knowledge of facts. Habitable Spaces had trouble raising the \$3300 application fee that the organization can't get back and had they known of the "new" interpretation they wouldn't have applied. The Bingo Division shouldn't change an interpretation without putting people on notice. This is a "fairness" issue because it is not fair that the Division changed its interpretation and did not publicize it and, as a result, Habitable Spaces was adversely impacted because it paid the $\$ 3300$ application fee.

# TEXAS LOTTERY COMMISSION, Petitioner <br> v. <br> HABITABLE SPACES, CONDUCTOR TAXPAYER NO. 14655567643, Applicant <br> <br> PROPOSAL FOR DECISION 

 <br> <br> PROPOSAL FOR DECISION}

In this case, the staff (Staff) of the Charitable Bingo Operations Division of the Texas Lottery Commission (Commission) proposes to deny the application of Habitable Spaces (Applicant) for a license to conduct charitable bingo operations. The Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) concludes Habitable Spaces failed to prove it was entitled to have its application granted and recommends that the Commission deny the application.

## I. JURISDICTION, NOTICE, AND PROCEDURAL HISTORY

The Commission has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to the Bingo Enabling Act (Act). ${ }^{1}$ The State Office of Administrative Hearings (SOAH) has jurisdiction over all matters relating to the conduct of a hearing in this proceeding, including the preparation of a proposal for decision with findings of fact and conclusions of law, pursuant to Texas Government Code chapter 2003.

On February 9, 2015, Habitable Spaces filed an application to obtain a license to conduct bingo as a fraternal organization. ${ }^{2}$ In a letter dated August 7, 2015, Staff notified Habitable Spaces that it was proposing to deny its application to conduct bingo. ${ }^{3}$ On August 25, 2015,

[^0]Habitable Spaces appealed the proposed denial and requested a hearing. ${ }^{4}$ A second amended notice of the hearing was sent to Habitable Spaces on October 27, 2015.5 The adequacy of the notice is not in dispute.

The hearing was convened before ALJ Beth Bierman on February 16, 2016. Assistant General Counsel Kristen Guthrie represented Staff. Eddie Heinemeier, Director of Habitable Spaces, represented Habitable Spaces. The hearing was adjourned and the record closed the same day.

## II. APPLICABLE LAW

Habitable Spaces applied for a license to conduct bingo as a fraternal organization. A fraternal organization is defined in the Act as "... a nonprofit organization organized to perform and engaged primarily in performing charitable, benevolent, patriotic, employment-related, or educational functions that meet the other requirements of [the Act.]", ${ }^{10}$

A nonprofit organization is defined as:
... an unincorporated association or a corporation that is incorporated or holds a certificate of authority under the Texas Non-Profit Corporation Act (Article 13961.01 et seq., Vernon's Texas Civil Statutes). The organization:
(A) may not distribute any of its income to its members, officers, or governing body, other than as reasonable compensation for services; and
(B) must have obtained tax exempt status under Section 501(c), Internal Revenue Code of 1986 . ${ }^{7}$

A fraternal organization seeking a license to conduct bingo must show that it has been organized as a fraternal organization in the State of Texas for at least three years prior to

[^1]submitting its application for a license to conduct bingo. During that three-year period, the fraternal organization must show that it has a bona fide membership that is actively and continuously engaged in furthering its charitable purpose. ${ }^{8}$

Staff seeks to deny Habitable Space's application because it contends:

1. Habitable Space has not demonstrated that it has been organized as a fraternal organization in Texas for at least three years prior to submitting its application;
2. The stated purpose of Habitable Spaces, as found in its bylaws, does not comport with the definition of a fraternal organization in the Act;
3. Habitable Spaces only acquired tax-exempt status from the Internal Revenue Service (IRS) in March 2014, which is less than three years prior to submitting its application; and
4. Habitable Spaces failed to show that during the three-year period prior to submitting its application it had a bona fide membership actively and continuously engaged as an organization in furthering its authorized purpose.

Habitable Spaces argues that it has been a fraternal organization performing charitable work since 2012. It believes it meets the definition of a fraternal organization and should be granted a license. Habitable Spaces alleges other fraternal organizations have been granted a license without having the tax-exempt status for three years. As the applicant, Habitable Spaces has the burden of proof by a preponderance of the evidence to show that its application should be granted. ${ }^{9}$

[^2]
## III. DISCUSSION

At the hearing, Staff had 11 exhibits admitted into evidence and presented the testimony of two Commission employees: Desira Glenn, Licensing and Accounting Services Manager; and Michelle Metzler, Licensing and Permit Specialist.

Habitable Spaces had one exhibit admitted. Christopher Shane Heinemeier, founding director and President for Habitable Spaces; ${ }^{10}$ and Alison Ward Heinemeier, founding director; testified for Habitable Spaces. Alice Banks, a former employee for the Commission, and Alfonso Royal III, the current Charitable Bingo Director for the Commission, were subpoenaed to testify by Habitable Spaces. Philip Sanderson, the former deputy director and director of the Charitable Bingo Division, and Stephen Fenoglio, an attorney who has previously practiced in front of the Commission, were called as expert witnesses on behalf of Habitable Spaces, but were not allowed to testify, along with Ms. Banks, because Habitable Spaces had not designated them as expert witnesses prior to the hearing in response to Staff's request for disclosure of expert witnesses.

## A. Staff's Testimony and Evidence

Ms. Glenn has been the Licensing and Accounting Services Manager for the Commission for four months. She oversees all of the licensing and accounting processes for the Commission and had reviewed the application and file in this case.

Ms. Glenn testified that Habitable Spaces did not have tax-exempt status for three years prior to its application because its application was filed in February 2015 and it did not receive tax-exempt status from the IRS until March 2014. Ms. Glenn further noted that Habitable Spaces did not show that it had been organized in Texas as a fraternal organization for three years, and did not have a bona fide membership for those three years. Habitable Spaces initially

[^3]had no voting members when it filed its Certificate of Formation in March 2014. ${ }^{11}$ This was corrected by filing a Certificate of Amendment with the Texas Secretary of State's Office in March 2015, which stated that the corporation would have voting members. ${ }^{12}$

Finally, Ms. Glenn testified that the stated purpose of Habitable Spaces, as listed in its bylaws, did not meet the definition of a fraternal organization. ${ }^{13}$ The bylaws state in relevant part:

The Corporation is organized exclusively for charitable and educational purposes as defined in Section 501(c)(3) of the Internal Revenue Code. These activities will include, but not be limited to[,] artist residency program, promoting public interest in the arts, supporting, encouraging, and educating public in both visual and performing arts, as well as providing a venue for public appreciation for the arts. ${ }^{14}$

According to Ms. Glenn, the information received from Habitable Spaces indicated that the organization was involved in the arts, farming, and gardening, which Staff contended did not meet the requirements of the Act. ${ }^{15}$ Ms. Glenn testified that education about art would not be considered a fraternal purpose because Staff received no evidence regarding the student/teacher environment or what was taught by Habitable Spaces.

Michelle Metzler is a Licensing and Permit Specialist in the Commission's Charitable Bingo Division. She has worked for the Commission for 17 years. Ms. Metzler testified that the application was initially denied because Habitable Spaces did not have tax-exempt status for three years prior to its application, and because it had not been organized in Texas for at least three years. Ms. Metzler testified she checked the tax-exempt status and found that the IRS had designated Habitable Spaces as "A20," which means Habitable Spaces is tax-exempt because of

[^4]its arts classification, not because of an educational purpose. ${ }^{16}$ In response to questions by Mr. Heinemeier, Ms. Metzler testified that she was not aware of any change in Commission policy with regard to the Commission enforcing the requirement that fraternal organizations must have three years of tax-exempt status prior to filing an application.

## B. Habitable Spaces's Testimony and Evidence

Mr. Heinemeier testified that Habitable Spaces is a sustainable farm and artist in residence program whose sole purpose is education for the surrounding community. The entity puts on lectures, seminars, and workshops regarding art to facilitate this purpose. Mr. Heinemeier testified that the mayor of Kingsbury, Texas, the city's attorney, and the local chamber of commerce supported Habitable Spaces and its charitable purpose. ${ }^{17}$

He testified that beginning in 2012, Habitable Spaces became the designated nonprofit host of the local annual Fall Harvest Festival. According to Mr. Heinemeier, the rural, agricultural, and arts communities come together at the festival; there are lectures and workshops. The local community can also sell and barter their crafts at the festival. He stated that Habitable Spaces does not engage in any performing arts. Mr. Heinemeier testified that the first charitable event put on by Habitable Spaces occurred in 2012. Mr. Heinemeier agreed that the art was taking place on his father's land, and that improvements to that land would, at least at this point, benefit his father.

Mr. Royal has been the Director of the Charitable Bingo Division since July 2014. He testified he was not aware of any change in policy with regard to whether a fraternal organization had to have a tax-exempt status for three years prior to the application for a license. He stated it was a long-standing interpretation of the division that an organization had to have the 501(c)(3) tax-exempt status for three years prior to application. According to Mr. Royal, the Act requires that the fraternal organization be a nonprofit organization. The nonprofit organization must have

[^5]a 501(c) tax exempt status. Under the Act, the fraternal organization must be in existence for three years prior to application. Hence, Mr. Royal contended that Habitable Spaces was required to have its tax-exempt status for three years prior to application.

Ms. Heinemeier testified that she and Mr. Heinemeier started Habitable Spaces. She stated that Habitable Spaces does not put on performing arts, but promotes and educates the public about the arts by giving lectures and workshops. She noted that the Fall Harvest Festival is of great benefit to the City of Kingsbury and the surrounding community. They formed Habitable Spaces to bring the arts back to the agricultural area.

Ms. Heinemeier contended that the IRS classification for art education is specifically for arts schools, not for an entity such as Habitable Spaces. She asserted that Habitable Spaces does educate the public about the arts by putting on workshops and lectures. Ms. Heinemeier has a Master of Fine Arts degree and Mr. Heinemeier has a Bachelor of Fine Arts degree. She stated that many of the artists holding the lectures or workshops are similarly qualified. She believed this supported Habitable Spaces's ability to educate about the arts.

## IV. ANALYSIS

Habitable Spaces is a nonprofit organization and seeks a license to conduct bingo as a fraternal organization. There is no dispute that Habitable Spaces received its tax-exempt status from the IRS in March 2014, less than three years before it submitted its license application to the Commission. The question is whether the Act and Commission rule require Habitable Spaces to have held that tax-exempt status for three years prior to filing the application, as urged by Staff.

Pursuant to Texas Occupations Code § 2001.002(19) and 16 Texas Administrative Code $\S 402.420$, Habitable Spaces is required, as a nonprofit organization, to have acquired taxexempt status under § 501(c) of the Internal Revenue Code. Until it acquires that tax-exempt status, it is not a nonprofit organization as defined by the Act or Commission rule. A fraternal organization is defined under the Act as a nonprofit organization. Under Texas Occupation Code
§ 2001.101(b), a fraternal organization seeking a license to conduct bingo must show that it has been organized as a fraternal organization in the State of Texas for at least three years prior to submitting its application for a license to conduct bingo. It follows, then, that the fraternal organization must meet the requirements of a nonprofit organization for three years prior to submitting its application to conduct bingo. One of these requirements is obtaining 501(c) taxexempt status. Because Habitable Spaces has not had 501(c) tax-exempt status for the required period of time, its application must be denied.

Staff also argues that the application should be denied because Habitable Spaces failed to show that it has been in existence in Texas as a fraternal organization for three years prior to submitting its application. Habitable Spaces filed its license application in February 2015, which means that it had to show it had been in existence as a fraternal organization in Texas, and as defined in the Act, prior to February 2012. The evidence showed that Habitable Spaces did not file its Certificate of Formation with the Secretary of State's Office until March 2014. And while there were minutes of meetings of the organization that were dated as early as January 2012, there is no evidence the group was a Texas fraternal organization meeting the requirements of the Act for three years prior to February 2015.

Staff next argues that Habitable Spaces failed to show that during the three-year period prior to submitting its application it had a bona fide membership actively and continuously engaged as an organization in furthering its authorized purpose. The evidence showed that Habitable Spaces did not have voting members until March 2015. As a result, it could not have a bona fide membership actively and continuously engaged as an organization in furthering its authorized purpose under the requirements of the Act.

Finally, Staff contends that the stated purpose of Habitable Spaces, as found in its bylaws, does not comport with the definition of a fraternal organization in the Act, based on an Attorney General Letter Opinion, which addressed questions related to the eligibility of a fraternal organization for a license to conduct bingo. The question addressed in the Letter Opinion was:

Assuming all other requirements are met, does a nonprofit organization organized to promote performing arts, whose primary activities are the preparation and performance of performing art productions, open to the general public who purchase tickets, qualify as a fraternal organization for a license to conduct bingo? ${ }^{18}$

The answer given in the opinion was:

Again, we find the description "to promote the performing arts" insufficient to apprise us of an organization's eligibility for licensure as a "fraternal organization," which must be one that "is organized to perform, and engages primarily in performing charitable, benevolent, patriotic, employment-related, or educational functions." ... A determination could only be made upon consideration of a particular organization's actual activities and organization. ${ }^{19}$

Staff interprets this opinion to disallow any activity related to the performing arts as a purpose for which a fraternal organization may qualify under the Act to conduct bingo. Notwithstanding the fact that Habitable Spaces denied it was involved in the performing arts, the ALJ does not read the opinion to go that far; rather, it appears to conclude that, without further evaluation of the specifics of an organization's actual activities and organization, the mere description of "promoting the public arts" is insufficient to reach any conclusion at all. Because Habitable Spaces's application must be denied because it did not have tax-exempt status for three years, did not show that it had been organized as a fraternal organization in the State of Texas for at least three years, and did not show it had a bona fide membership for three years, the ALJ does not reach a conclusion with regard to whether Habitable Spaces's stated purpose in its bylaws would automatically make it ineligible to hold a license to conduct bingo.

For these reasons, the ALJ concludes Habitable Spaces failed to prove it is eligible to be licensed to conduct bingo, and its application should be denied.

[^6]
## V. FINDINGS OF FACT

1. On February 9, 2015, Habitable Spaces filed an application to conduct bingo as a fraternal organization with the Texas Lottery Commission (Commission).
2. On August 7, 2015, the staff (Staff) of the Commission notified Habitable Spaces that it was proposing to deny its license application.
3. On August 25, 2015, Habitable Spaces appealed the proposed denial and requested a hearing.
4. A second Amended Notice of Hearing was sent to Habitable Spaces on October 27, 2015. The notice contained a statement of the time, place, and nature of the hearing; a statement of the legal authority and jurisdiction under which the hearing was to be held; a reference to the particular sections of the statutes and rules involved; and a short, plain statement of the matters asserted.
5. In March 2014, Habitable Spaces filed its Certificate of Formation with the Texas Secretary of State's Office.
6. In March 2014, Habitable Spaces received its tax-exempt status under § 501(c)(3) of the Internal Revenue Code.
7. When it filed its Certificate of Formation in March 2014, Habitable Spaces had no voting members.
8. In March 2015, Habitable Spaces filed a Certificate of Amendment with the Texas Secretary of State's Office, to indicate that Habitable Spaces would have voting members.
9. Habitable Spaces did not have tax-exempt status for three years prior to its application.
10. Habitable Spaces did not show it had a bona fide membership for three years prior to its application.
11. The hearing was held on February 16, 2016, before Administrative Law Judge Beth Bierman. Kristen Guthrie represented Staff; Eddie Heinemeier represented Habitable Spaces. The record closed that day.

## VI. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Commission has jurisdiction over this matter. Tex Occ. Code ch. 2001.
2. The State Office of Administrative Hearings (SOAH) has jurisdiction over all matters relating to the conduct of a hearing in this proceeding, including the preparation of a proposal for decision with findings of fact and conclusions of law. Tex. Gov't Code ch. 2003.
3. Habitable Spaces has the burden of proof in this proceeding. Tex. Occ. Code § 2001.352(b).
4. A fraternal organization is a nonprofit organization organized to perform and engaged primarily in performing charitable, benevolent, patriotic, employment-related, or educational functions that meet the other requirements of the Bingo Enabling Act. Tex. Occ. Code 2001.002(11).
5. A nonprofit organization is an unincorporated association or a corporation that is incorporated or holds a certificate of authority under the Texas Non-Profit Corporation Act (Article 1396-1.01 et seq., Vernon's Texas Civil Statutes). Tex. Occ. Code § 2001.002(19).
6. A nonprofit organization must obtain a tax-exempt status under Section 501(c), Internal Revenue Code of 1986. Tex. Occ. Code § 2001.002(19)(B).
7. A fraternal organization seeking a license to conduct bingo must show that it has been organized as a fraternal organization in the State of Texas for at least three years and must show that it has a bona fide membership that is actively and continuously engaged in furthering its charitable purpose. Tex. Occ. Code § 2001.101(b)(1), (2).
8. A fraternal organization seeking a license to conduct bingo must have obtained taxexempt status under Section 501(c) for three years prior to submitting its application for a license to conduct bingo. Tex. Occ. Code §§ 2001.002(19)(B), 2001.101(b)(1), (2); 16 Tex. Admin. Code § 402.420.
9. Adequate and timely notice of the hearing was provided. Tex. Gov’t Code $\S \S$ 2001.051. 052.
10. Habitable Spaces's application should be denied.

## SIGNED April 18, 2016.




## Guthrie, Kristen

## From:

Sent:
To:
Subject:
Attachments:
Eddie Heinemeier [eddieh@staffprotexas.com](mailto:eddieh@staffprotexas.com)
Thursday, May 05, 2016 4:58 PM
Beth Bierman; Guthrie, Kristen; shane heinemeier
Habitable Spaces PFD and Exceptions
LMS License - Amendment.html; LMS Athletic Booster Club Original Bingo License application package.pdf; LMS Bingo License.pdf

## Dear Administrative Law Judge Bierman:

I received the Proposal for Decision in this matter. As we said at the hearing, previously the Division issued licenses to organizations that did not have tax exempt status for at least 3 consecutive years before the issuance of the license. Also, our position is that Habitable Spaces has been organized as a fraternal organization in Texas for at least 3 years, had a voting membership, and had a bona fide membership that is actively and continuously engage in furthering its charitable purpose for the requisite period of time.

After the hearing, I did get an example of the Division's past practice. Enclosed is an Application for LMS Athletic Booster Club. The organization submitted its license application on January 10, 2014 and then withdrew the application because it apparently didn't have proper verification from the IRS. Once it obtained the verification, it resubmitted its application on March 21, 2014. You can see that the effective date of exemption is September 3, 2013. Also, please note that LMS Athletic Booster Club was formed as a nonprofit corporation in September 2013. The Division issued the license. If you don't believe you can rely on the information I've submitted without it being formally part of the record, then we request you re-open the record in order for this information to be part of the record. For your information, I submitted a Public Information Act request to the Texas Lottery Commission to obtain copies of applications similar to this one. The response I received was that, after conducting a reasonable search, the Commission did not locate any documents responsive to my request. The attached was obtained through a Public Information Act request to the Commission, after the one I submitted.

We take exception with Conclusion of Law No. 8 which concludes that a fraternal organization seeking a license to conduct bingo must have obtained tax-exempt status under Section 501(c) for three years prior to submitting its application for a license to conduct bingo. We take exception to Conclusion of Law No. 7 and Finding of Fact No. 10 because they conclude an organization can't amend documents to correct incorrect information, such as the fact that Habitable Spaces did have voting members and did have a bona fide membership for 3 years prior to its application. We also take exception to Conclusion of Law No. 10 which concludes the application should be denied. If the Division wants to change its interpretation of the applicable statutes and the rules from its previous interpretation that organizations have relied on when submitting their applications and license application fees, it should only do so after notifying interested persons of a change in its interpretation. Habitable Spaces submitted a $\$ 3300$ license application fee that it can't get back from the Division. Had the Division notified interested persons it was changing its interpretation, Habitable Spaces wouldn't have submitted the application and paid $\$ 3300$. That may not seem like a lot of money but it is to a non-profit organization.

We respectfully request that you amend the Proposal for Decision and conclusions of law to indicate that the Division's previous interpretation was that an organization only had to have obtained tax exempt status before the issuance of the license and that the Habitable Spaces did have voting members and a bona fide membership for the requisite period of time. If the Division wants to change its previous interpretation that interested persons have relied on, it should only be able to do so after formal notification of a change in its interpretation. We believe the Commission should have amended its rules to put interested persons on notice of the change in interpretation.

Dear Judge Bierman, I hope you will reconsider your Proposal for Decision. It is not fair to non-profit organizations that apply for licenses and pay costly application fees to have applications denied just because there has been a change in the Division's interpretation of the statutes and rules, with no formal notice to interested persons. Thank you.

## Eddie A. Heinemeier

Designated Agent \& Director
3239-1 Rustic Oak
San Antonio, TX 78261
(830) 980-2694
(830) 980-2694 fax
(210) 296-9944 cell
eddieh@staffprotexas.com

## Churitable Bingo Operations Division Texas Application for an Origixal License to Conduct Charitable Bingo

## 






SharnonMontez
 $\qquad$
$\qquad$ $=512-790-485 x$

$\square$


 I (












$\qquad$

## \#NOC MFORHAHTVN






ORGANHEATION LOCATJON
14.

IWF:

L 1703 Lions Den

i. Lar $E=$

TX: $\frac{78041}{\text { and }}$
Williomsom
is cisinges orics

気
PLAYHEG EOCATION
15. 690 N Bacdad $\qquad$
5125764894


- 690 N Bagdad








LESSOR INEORMATHOR
t9. 1 HNFL $\qquad$ 743006307


$\qquad$
Round Rock $\qquad$
EINEO OHARPEERSON


Frederick: Laurie

$\square$
 $\square$
 $\square$
1703 icns Den




## 

族. Has a



 tee wexnysherd.




 $\qquad$ Isay $\qquad$ A. 0. Mexk $\qquad$
$x$ $\qquad$
SEx
Count cionk ot $\qquad$ Name of county





## CERTGFICATION OF RESPONSUBLLITY


 cil that hegisty of Approven Ginge Workes and as art operator on stineadie is.






 cí fis bense.




In reply refer to: 9999999999 Oet. 1,2013 LTR 3367C $\$ 0$ 74-2970218 00000000 00025121
BOLC: TE

LMS ATHLETYC booster CLUB 410 SOUTH WEST DR LEANDER TX T864I

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { Employer Ioentification Number: } 74-2970218 \\
& \text { Tax Form: } 1025 \\
& \text { Document kocator Number: } 17053-263-31600-3 \\
& \text { For assistance, cald: } 1-877-829-5500
\end{aligned}
$$

Dear Applicant,
We received your application for exemption from federal income tax
and yous user fee payment.
During the injtial review process applications for exemption are separated into three groups:

1. Those that can be processed immediately based on information
2. Those that need minor additional information ta be resolved, and
3. Those that require additional development.

If your application falis in the first group or second groupy you widit
receive your determination letter stating that ypu are axempt from
Federal income tax or a request for information via phone, fax, or Jetter. If your appijcation falls within the thirdgroup, you wili be cantacted when your application has been assigned to an Exemot Organizations specialist for technical review. You can expect to be contacted within approximately 90 days. from..the date of this. natice

IRS does not issue wtax mxempt numbers" or "tax exampt aertypycatesk for state or local sales or income taxes, If you need mxemption from these taxesy contact your state or local tax offices.

Goneral information about tho applioation process and tax-exemption can be found by visiting our website, wwhyirs.gov/eo. If you are unable to locata the information needed, you may call our toll free number shown above Monday through Friday. When communicating with us please refor to the employer hdentification number and document locetor number shown abowe.

Sign up for Exemot Orgamizations" EO Updatey a requiar enmail newsietter that highlights Hew information posted on the charities meges of irs.gav. Ta subseribe, go to whw. irs.gov/eo and cilick on

January 10,2014
To Whom it May Concern,

Attached is an application package for LMS Athletic Booster Club to request a License to Conduct Bingo.

The package includes:

- Schedule W1-Signed by the Bingo Chairperson operator
- Schedule B-
- Texas Application for an Onfginal License to Conduct Charitable Bingo
- Minutes from 2011 § 2013. We are also submitting "Texas Franchise Tax Ownership Information Report" for years $2008,2009,2010,2011$ to indicate that our organization has been in existence.
- Letter from the IRS indicating that they have received form 1023 requesting reinstatement of our 501 c .3 status. As of today, the application has yet to be assigned to a caseworker.
- \$100 application fee

Should you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at 512-799-6852 or at shannon, montezoyahoó.com.

Sincerely,


Shannon M. Monte
Treasurer- LMS Athletic Booster Club

Sharon Monte
Tuesday April 15.20142 .51 PM
Dorm, Donna
Montez Shannon;
Supplarnental forms for LMS Athletic Booster club



Ins articles of incoroporation.poff; LMS Athletic Booster Club By w Laws dated 224 1998, dock; 08 2011 bank statement.pdfi Aug 2012 BKST.pdf; August 2013 bank 5 tatement.pdf; Feb 2014 bank statement.pof; LMS Athletic Booster Club minutez 5,10.11.docx; Minutes for General Meeting - 12-10-13 LM 5 Athletic Booster Club.pdf; Minutes For General Meeting - 12-10-13 LMS Athletic Booster Club.pdf, LMS Athletic Booster club membership list. doc

## Dona,

"Tanks for your patience, ham atheling the following:

1. Bank Account information for 3 separate years
2. Minutes from 3 separate years. I could not locate minutes from 2012 but am providing minutes from 2014, 2012 \& 2011 to show existence for at least 8 years.
3. Copy of Bi-Laws
4. Articles of Incorporation
5. List of membership

Prase let me brow if you need any other documents or if you have issues opening these.


Noie to Customers Prating by Chent Accome: This is not a bill. Pqynens to your chent accourn should be besed on the monthly statement and not this packlng sfitp. Amounts crodited to your client accoumt may be refunded upon request Refurds (if applicable) will bo processed within 10 business days.

User ID: AHURTALD

# Office of the Secretary of State 

September 06, 2013

$S$ Maritez<br>3506 Bachetor Gutch<br>Leander "TX 78641 USA<br>RE: Leander Middle School Athletic Boogter Club<br>File Number: 801845324

It has been our pleasure to file the certificate of formation and issue the cadoted certifinate of fing evidencing the existence of the newly creafed nomprofit corporation.
Nonproft comprations do not atromatically qualify for an exempion from federal and state taxes. Shortly, the Comptroller of Public Accounts will be contacting the corporation at its registered office five information that will assist the Comptoller in setting up the framehise tax account for the corpoxation. Information about franchise tax, and contact information for the Comptroller's office, is available on their web site at hthe://window.state.tx.us/taxinfo/franchisc/index. himl. For information on slate tax exemption, includixg applications and publications, visit the Comptraller's Exempt Organizations wheh site at hitpi//window, state $x$ uns/taxinfo/exemptindex. htm, Iniormation on exemption from federal taxes is available from the Internal Revenue Service web site at www.ins. Rov,
Nonprofit corporations do not file armal reports with the Secretary of State, bat do file a report not more often than once every four years as requested by the Secretary. It is important for the corporation to continuously maintain a registered ngent and office in Texas as this is the address to which the Secretary of State will send a request to file a periodic report. Failure to maintain a registered agent or office in Texas, fature to file a change to the agem or office information, or failure to file a report when requested may result in the involuntary termination of the corporation. Acditionally, a nomprofit corporation will file doctuments with the Secretary of State if the coporetion needs to amend ont of the provisions in its certifictute of formation. If we can be of further service at any time, please let us know.

Sincerely,
Corporations Section
Rusiness \& Public Ftings Division
(512) 463-5555

Enclosure


# Office of the Secretary of State 

# CERTLEICATE OF FRLNG OF 

Leander Middle School Athletic Booster Club

File Number: 801845324

The undersigned, as Secretary of Sute of Texas, heraby certifies that a Cextificate of Formation for the above named Domestic Norprofil Corporation has been receityed in this office and has been found to conform to the applicable prowisions of law.

ACCORDINGLY, the undersigned, as Secretary of State, and by virtue of the authority vested in the gecretary by law, hereby issues this certificate evidencing thiling effective on the date shown below.

The issuance of this certifieate does not authotize the use of a name in this stare in violation of the rights of another under the federal Trademank Act of 1946 , the Texas trademark law, the Assumed Business or Professional Name Act, or the common law.

Dated: 09/03/2013
Effective: 09/03/2013



John Steen
Secretary of State


## Article 1 - Entity Name and Type

The filing entity being formed it a nomprofit corparation The nand of the entity is:
Leander Middle School A.thjetic Booster Club

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { Articke 2-Registered Agent and Registered Otfäce }
\end{aligned}
$$

5 A. The inital registered agent is art orgatization ceamon be entity named above; by the name of:

## ${ }^{0} 8$.

 $\frac{\text { Shantun Mmit }}{\text { Firni*ume }}$ Lasi iobine
C. The business address of the rigistered agent and the registered office address is:
$\frac{410 \mathrm{SWestSt}}{\text { Siraer Addreast }}$

## Article 3 - Management

The managernent of the affairs of the corporation is wested in the board of ditectors. The number of directors constituting the inditial boatd of divectors and the names and addresses of the persons who are to serve as directors until the first annual meeting of members or until their successors are elected and quilified are as follows:

| A stinimum of three directors in required. |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Heather | Beach |  | $s_{\text {ufilix }}$ |  |
| Fitss Limme | 1. 1. |  |  |  |
| 410 S West St | Leander | TX | 78641 |  |
| Stretre or Mailing , wdithes | Cit | state | Zip 「ode | Conatit |



OR
[] The management of the affaixs of ibe cotpontion is to bevested in the wonprofic corporation's members.

## Article 4 - Membership

(See itratructions. Do not select statement $B$ if the corporacion is to be managed by its members.)
$\otimes$ A. The nonprofit corporation shatl bave netubers.
B. The nomprofit corporation will have no members.

Article 5 - Purpase

The nomprofit corporation is organized for the following purpose or purposes:
Maintain an organization whith helps to promote activities and further the goals of the Leander Midele Schools athletic program.


## Supplemental Provisions/information

(Bee insruetions.)
Text stes: The attached addendum, if any, is incorporated berein by seference.

Organtzer
The name and address of the organizer:
Shanoon Montez

| Name |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 410 |  |  |  |
| S West St | Lemander | TX | 78641 |
| Streest or Mailing Addreas | Cin | Stais | $24 p$ Code |

Effectiveness of Fithing (Sulect ether A, B. or C.
A. 区his document becomes effective when the document is filed by the secretary of state.
B. $\square$ This document becomes effective at a later date, which is not more than minety (90) days from the date of signing, The delayed effective date is: $\qquad$
©. This rocurnemt takes effect upon the occurcuce of \& future event or fact, other than the passage of time. The $90^{\text {th }}$ day after the date of signing is:
The following event or fact witl cause the dochment to take effect in the manner described below:

## Execution

The undersigned affirms that the persom designated as registered agent has consented to the appoinment. The undersigned signs this document subjeot to the penalities imposed by law for the submission of a materially false or frauduient instrument and certifies tunder penalty of perjury that the undersigned is authorized to execute the filitug instrument.

Date: $0816 / 2013$


## 015084003930

## BINGO LICENSING, ADMINISTRATIVE PENALTY AND CONSENT ORDER <br> DISTRIBUTION FORM

| POSTMARIK DATE: | 3-2y-14 |
| :---: | :---: |
| TAXPAYER NUMBER: | $1742^{9702180}$ |
| TAXPAYER NAME: | \$ LMS AtMletic Booster clubs |

## MICENSE

| ORIGINAL: | $\$$ | $-1.32,00$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| RENEWAL: | $\$$ |  |
| AMENDMENT: | $\$$ |  |
| TEMPORARX: | $\$$ |  |

## BOND

| $A M O U N T$ | $125,0 C$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |

## ADMONISTRATIVE PENALTY

| AMOUNT _ | $\$$ |
| :--- | :--- |

CONSENT ORDER (Agreed Order) - \#

| AMOUNT | $\$$ |
| :--- | :--- |
|  |  |



To Whom it May Concem,

L MS Antetic Booster Club is resubmitting the Texas Application For Original License to Conduct Charitable. We had previously submitted the application but had to withdraw our application, as we did not have proper verification from the IRS. We have recently obtained documentation from the IRS indicating that we are a non-prolit organization (50lco).

We are resubmitting the application along wild the Calculation of Annual License Fec and Security.

Both myself and Heather Beach have viewed both the Bingo Training Program and the PrcLicense Interview Training.

Should you have any questions, please contact Sharon Montes at or 512-799-68,52.


Shan on Monte
Treasurer LMS Adalctic Booster Club


E. O. BOK $250 \%$


Dates: MAR 172014

47.0 90

Bing loyer Xdontification oumber:
74-2970218
DLR:
17053265316003
Contact Paston,
1HAROH $\downarrow$ FODOR
Contact Watqyhore Number:
(877) 829-5500

Asecumbing Pariod Encling:

Publise Churity gtatitu: 509 (a) (2)
Epxin 990 Requizeaf \%
Refective Date of Exemption: Sspermber 3, zot3
Contatbution Dearistibility; Yes
AdCendars Appilies; NH

## Deas Appldoantz



 deatuctible under sqotion 270 of the cole you are axwo malifiled to receive tow deductible bactuasts, devises, transfex or gifte under seation 2055,2106




 まettak:

 exempt organization.
sinceraly,



## CHECKLIST

## REQUIRED FORGS AND PAPERWORK TO INCLUDE AS PARTT OF YOUR APPEICATION:

Frease enslire that all of the following forms, fres and documents are submsited when applying for an original Iloense to conduct bingo:

1. Texas Application for Origina! License to Conduct Gingo form
2. License Fee - Submit a check made payeble to the State Comptriker in the Arme unt made calcuilated in Item 21
3. Bond - Sutbriit a chear made payable to the Steite Comptroller or Schedude C - Assigriment of for Bingo Priza Fees or Schedule D - Cordinuouk Band of Eingo Licenso in the amrount calcuated in temzo.
4. Schadude A - Evidance of Ellgibility - Subrnis ell documents requested bassod on tha type of organization you are applying as.
5. Schectule B- hotvidugls for Licensse to Conduct Bingo
6. Texas Application for Registry of Appraved Bingo whoners
7. Enngob Trainting Program ~ T"ne Bingo Chaiperson must aitend this training course betore itis license may be issuad. Class information is avalaj! se www.trbinaco.org.
 oparator mustattend this trairing coursa befira the licensemay be issued. This wab based training is available at wow, txblingo.org-

## APPLICATION \&UBMISSION

PLEAEE SUBMIT YOUR COIMPLETED APPLIOATION, ALL SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION AND THE APPRGFFIATE LCENSE FEE JO:
by mall:
CHARITABLE BINGO OPERATIONS DIVISION
TEXAS LOTTEFY COMMISEION

AUSTIN, TEXAS 7876T-8630
1-800-EiNGO-77 (1-890-240-4677)
for delivery:
CHARITABLE GINGO OPERATION\$ DVISION TEXAS LOTGERY COMMISENON 641 E. 6TH STREET AUSTIN, TEXAS 78701-37t5 1-800-BiNGO-77 ( $1-800-240-4677)$

Plosese retain these instucliens and a copy of your completed application for your files.


ヶndaidum
|:ロ1:1!

June 23, 2014
LMS Athletic Booster Club
410 S West Dr
Leander, Texas 78641-1850

Taxpayer \# 17429702180

Dear Ms. Montez,
This will acknowledge receipt of the application to conduct bingo for the above referenced organization. The license is granted as set out below:

| Day(s) \& Time(s): | Tuesday 07:00 PM to 10:00 PM |
| :--- | :--- |
| Location: | Booster Bingo Leander <br> 11880 Old 2243 W Ste 301 <br> Leander, Texas 78641-8594 |
|  | Heather Beach <br> 1810 Laurel Ln <br> Leander, Texas 78641-8627 |

This letter is effective June 24, 2014 and will continue to be in effective until the receipt of your original annual license.

If you have any questions, please contact this office at 1-800-BINGO-77 (246-4677),


## A COPY OF THIS LETTER MUST BE DISPLAYED ON PREMISES

# Texas Lottery Commission 

<br>

TEXAS
© m: bi vi


Hiociles

June 23, 2014

HEATHER BEACH
LMS ATHLETIC BOOSTER CLUB
410 S WEST DR
LEANDER, TX 78541-1850

Dear Licensee.
Please note that in the upper right hand corner of this letter is a Personal Identification Number (P.IN.) unique to your organization. Please refer to this P.I.N. when telephoning day or time change amendments to the Commission. We will be unable to process any changes without this number. We suggest that you safeguard this P.I.N. and supply it only to the individuals authorized to make these changes. Amendment applications maybe telephoned to the Commission at 1-800-246-4677.

Day and time change amendments will be accepted via facsimile machine on the attached Amendment Application only. This form MUST be completed in its entirety and include the signature of the bingo chairperson and an officer of your organization. Once completed, the form should be faxed to 1-512-344-5142.

Both day and time change amendments may be received by the Commission via telephone and facsimile machine between the hours of 8:00 AM. through 5:00 P.M. C.S.T. Monday through Friday with the exception of State Holidays. These applications MUST be received a minimum of four (4) hours in advance of the proposed change.

The license fee for an amendment application is $\$ 10.00$. Prepayment of this fee must be received at the Texas Lottery Commission Headquarters prior to the receipt of any amendment application. Your organization may submit excess license fees to create a credit balance to be used for this purpose. To do so, please submit a bingo bank account check indicating in writing that the funds are to be used for future amendments.

Amendment applications that would include a change in organization name, bingo chairperson, playing location or primary business location must be mailed to the Commission.

Should you have any questions please contact our office at 1-800-BINGO-77(246-4677).

Sincerely,


Debbie Parpounas, Acting Director Charitable Bingo Operations Division

TEXAS LOTTERY COMMISSION, Petitioner
v.

HABITABLE SPACES, Applicant

BEFORE THE STATE OFFICE

## OF

## ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

THE COMMISSION'S REPLY TO APPLICANT'S EXCEPTIONS TO THE ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE'S PROPOSAL FOR DECISION

TO THE HONORABLE ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE BETH BIERMAN:
Texas Lottery Commission, Charitable Bingo Operations Division (the Commission), files its Reply to Applicant's Exceptions to the Administrative Law Judge's (ALJ) Proposal for Decision (PFD).

## I. <br> Introduction

Applicant Habitable Spaces (Applicant) emailed its Exceptions in this proceeding to the Commission on May 5, 2016. The Commission first objects to Applicant's service via email, given that the Commission and Applicant have not agreed that service via email is acceptable. The Commission also objects to Applicant's attempt to submit evidence after the record has been closed. The Commission has had no opportunity to present testimony and other evidence to dispute or explain the new evidence Applicant attempts to seek admitted after the record has closed. Without waiving the objections stated above, and as discussed below, Applicant's Exceptions to Conclusions of Law No. 7 and 8 are contrary to the evidence presented at the hearing in the matter. The ALJ correctly found that Applicant's application failed for at least two reasons.

## II.

## The ALJ Correctly Found That the Application Should Be Denied Because Applicant Did Not Have 501(c) Tax-Exempt Status For Three Years Prior To Its Application Date.

Applicant takes exception to Conclusion of Law No. 8 regarding the requirement that a fraternal organization seeking a conductor bingo license have obtained exempt Section 501(c) status from the Internal Revenue Service (IRS) for three years prior to submitting its application. As noted in the PFD, the three-year period for 501 (c) tax-exempt status is a statutory requirement of the Bingo Enabling Act (Act), (Chapter 2001, Tex. Occ. Code Ann.). The following Act provisions, read together, require the 501 (c) status to be held for three years prior to the time of application in order to meet the eligibility requirement for a "fraternal organization", because: (1) A fraternal organization is defined as a "nonprofit organization"; (2) To qualify as a non-profit organization, the organization must have 501(c) tax-exempt status; and (3) The fraternal organization (defined as a nonprofit organization having 501(c) tax-exempt status) must have been organized in this state for at least three years:

Tex. Occ. CODE ANN. § 2001.002(11) defines "fraternal organization" as: "A nonprofit organization organized to perform and engaged primarily in performing charitable, benevolent, patriotic, employment-related, or educational functions that meet the other requirements of this chapter." (emphasis added)

Tex. Occ. CODE ANN. § 2001.002(19) defines "nonprofit organization" as: "An unincorporated association or a corporation that is incorporated or holds a certificate of authority under the Texas Non-Profit Corporation Act (Article 13961.01 et seq., Vernon's Texas Civil Statutes). The organization:
(A) may not distribute any of its income to its members, officers, or governing body, other than as reasonable compensation for services; and
(B) must have obtained tax exempt status under Section 501(c), Internal Revenue Code of 1986." (emphasis added)

TEX. Occ. CODE ANN. § 2001.101(b)(1) and (2) state, in part: "(b) A fraternal organization:
(1) must have been organized in this state for at least three years;
(2) must have had during the three year period a bona fide membership actively and continuously engaged as an organization in furthering its charitable purposes." (emphasis added)

Accordingly, an organization can only meet the three-year eligibility requirement as a fraternal organization if it has been a nonprofit organization having 501(c) tax-exempt status for at least three years. A conductor applicant is required as a nonprofit organization to have acquired tax exempt status from the IRS. Until the 501 (c) status is acquired, an organization does not meet the definition in the Act as a nonprofit organization. It is undisputed that Applicant did not have tax-exempt status from the IRS until March of 2014.

Applicant in its Exceptions inappropriately seeks to admit new evidence to show that on one past occasion the Commission issued a license to a conductor organization that did not have Section 501 (c) status for three years prior to its application. Desira Glenn, Licensing and Accounting Services Manager, testified for the Commission at the hearing that, in the past, it was possible that such licenses inadvertently were issued due to lack of proper checks in place.' However, since Ms. Glenn's hiring in October of 2015, and as she testified at the hearing, procedures now are in place to ensure the Act and Commission rules are consistently and properly enforced in screening applications for conductor licenses, specifically, with regard to the required three-year period of Section 501(c) status prior to approval of an application. ${ }^{2}$ The law is clear, regardless of any past instance where it inadvertently may not have been enforced by Commission staff. In any event, any such action by Commission staff does not constitute Commission policy; and certainly does not provide a basis to bind the Commission to violate the Act, as Applicant suggests, until "interested persons" are notified of the Commission's change in policy.

[^7]
## III.

The Application Should Be Denied Because, as the ALJ Correctly Found, Applicant Failed To Show It Has Been Organized as a Fraternal Organization in Texas For at Least Three Years With a Bona Fide Membership That Was Actively and Continuously Engaged in Furthering Its Charitable Purpose.

The basis for Applicant's exception to Conclusion of Law No. 7 is that Applicant merely asserts that it did have voting members and a bona fide membership for three years prior to its application. However, this assertion is contrary to the documentary evidence presented at hearing. Applicant did not file its Certificate of Formation with the Secretary of State's Office until March 2014, and did not have voting members until March 2015.3 The PFD states, "And while there were minutes of meetings of the organization that were dated as early as January 2012, there is no evidence the group was a Texas fraternal organization meeting the requirements of the Act for three years prior to February 2015."

Again, Applicant in its Exceptions improperly seeks to admit new evidence in stating that one previously-licensed entity, LMS Athletic Booster Club, was only incorporated in September 2013, and issued a license when it applied in March of 2014. As stated previously, the Commission had no opportunity to counter the new evidence Applicant seeks to admit. TEX. Occ. CODE ANN. §2001.101(b)(1) and (2) require a fraternal organization seeking a license to conduct bingo to show that it has been organized as a fraternal organization in the State of Texas for at least three years and must show it has a bona fide membership that was actively and continuously engaged in furthering its charitable purpose. As correctly noted in the PFD, Applicant failed to show that during the three-year period prior to submitting its application it had a bona fide membership actively and continuously engaged as an organization in furthering its authorized purpose.

[^8]
## IV. <br> Conclusion

The ALJ properly found that Applicant's application should have been denied for at least two independent reasons. Either reason, in and of itself, would warrant a denial of the application. Therefore, Applicant failed to meet its burden of proof that its application should have been approved. For the reasons stated above, the Commission respectfully requests the ALJ to reject the Applicant's Exceptions.

Respectfully submitted,


KRISTEN GUTHRIE
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Lottery Commission
P.O. Box 16630

Austin TX 78761
Tel. 512-344-5475
Fax 512-344-5189

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on May 20, 2016, a true and correct copy of The Commission's Reply to Applicant's Exceptions to the Administrative Law Judge's Proposal for Decision was served on the following individuals at the locations and in manners listed below, pursuant to 1 Tex. Admin. Code § 155.103 and Tex. R. Civ. P. 21.

$$
917199 \text { 9991 } 703085418678
$$

Via CMRRR 9171999991703085418677 and First Class Mail
Mr. Christopher Heinemeier
Habitable Spaces
3050 FM 1104
Kingsbury, TX 78638-2533

$$
\text { ף1 アコף9 9991 } 703085418684
$$

Via CMRRR 9171999991703085418684 and First Class Mail
Mr. Eddie Heinemeier
3239-1 Rustic Oak
San Antonio, TX 78261


Kristen Guthrie
Assistant General Counsel

# State Office of Administrative Hearings 



Lesli G. Ginn
Chief Administrative Law Judge
June 2, 2016
Gary Grief
VIA FACSIMILE NO. 512/478/3682
Executive Director
Texas Lottery Commission
611 East Sixth Street
Austin, Texas 78701
RE: Docket No. 362-15-5571.B; Texas Lottery Commission v. Habitable Spaces, Conductor Taxpayer No. 14655567643

## Dear Mr. Grief:

I have reviewed the exceptions to the Proposal for Decision (PFD) filed by Habitable Spaces and the reply filed by the Commission Staff. The evidence and the law presented in the case were considered and weighed carefully before the PFD was issued. The exceptions do not raise any issues not previously considered by the Administrative Law Judge. Therefore, it is my recommendation that the PFD be adopted without change.

Sincerely,


Beth Bierman
Administrative Law Judge

BB/eh
cc: Kristen Guthrie, Assistant General Counsel, Texas Lottery Cormmission, 611 E. $6^{\text {th }}$, Austin Texas 78701 - VIA FACSIMILE NO. 512/344-5189
Chuistopher Heinemeir, Habitable Spaces, 3050 FM. 1104, Kingsbury, Texas 78638-2533 - VIA FACSIMILE NO. 830-980-2694

SOAH DOCKET NO. 362-15-5571.B

| TEXAS LOTTERY COMMISSION, | $\S$ | BEFORE THE STATE OFFICE |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Petitioner | $\S$ |  |
| v. | $\S$ |  |
| HABITABLE SPACES, | $\S$ |  |
| CONDUCTOR TAXPAYER NO. | $\S$ |  |
| 14655567643, | $\S$ |  |
| Applicant | $\S$ |  |
|  |  |  |
|  | ORDER NO. 3 |  |

On May 6, 2016, Mr. Heinemeier, the representative for Habitable Spaces (Applicant), emailed the Applicant's exceptions to the Proposal for Decision directly to the undersigned Administrative Law Judge (ALJ) and to the staff attorney for the Charitable Bingo Operations Division of the Texas Lottery Commission (Commission). It is improper to directly email pleadings to the ALJ.

The Rules of Practice and Procedure of the State Office of Administrative Hearings, 1 Texas Administrative Code ch. 155, control this case. Copies of the rules may be found at www.soah.state.tx.us, or a copy may be obtained by contacting SOAFI's Docketing Division. The parties are expected to familiarize themselves with these rules, and to abide by them. Under those rules, any requests for relief, including exceptions to the PFD and replies to those exceptions, must be communicated to the ALJ by written motion and served on the other party to the case. Although the parties may agree to accept service by email from each other, the parties may not file their documents with SOAH by emailing them directly to the ALJ.

There are four methods for filing a document with SOAH. Non-confidential pleadings and other documents shall be filed with SOAH by one of these following methods:

1. by mail addressed to P.O. Box 13025, Austin, Texas 78711-3025;
2. by hand delivery to 300 West 15 th Street, Room 504;
3. by fax to (512) $322-2061$; or
4. by electronic upload via SOAH's Electronic Case Information System found on SOAH's public website, as explained below.

SOAH's Electronic Case Information System may be accessed from SOAH's website at www.soah.state.tx.us. Click the "Electronic Case Files" link at the upper right-hand corner of SOAH's home page to enter the system. To upload documents, click on "Upload a document" in the upper left hand comer. The system will prompt you to either $\log$ in to your account or create a new user account. Emailing a document directly to the AL.J or to the ALJ's Administrative Assistant is not considered to be filing that document with SOAH.

The deadline for filing exceptions to the PFD is today, May 6, 2016. The ALJ will print the email received from Mr. Heinemeier, including the two printable attachments, ${ }^{1}$ and have it filed with SOAH. Future pleadings from the Applicant should be filed with SOAH using one of the four methods described above.

SIGNED May 6, 2016.


[^9]
[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Tex. Occ. Code chapter 2001.
    ${ }^{2}$ Staff Ex. 9.
    ${ }^{3}$ Staff Ex. 1.

[^1]:    ${ }^{4}$ Staff Ex. 2.
    ${ }^{5}$ Staff Ex. 3.
    ${ }^{6}$ Tex. Occ. Code § $2001.002(11)(\mathrm{A})$.
    ${ }^{7}$ Tex. Occ. Code § 2001.002(19); 16 Tex. Admin. Code $\S 402.420$.

[^2]:    ${ }^{8}$ Tex. Occ. Code § 2001.101(b).
    ${ }^{9}$ Tex. Occ. Code § 2001.352(b).

[^3]:    ${ }^{10}$ Mr. Heinemeier currently works for the Briscoe Western Art Museum in San Antonio, Texas, as the museum preparator, or steward of the arts.

[^4]:    ${ }^{11}$ Staff Ex. 7 at 2.
    ${ }^{12}$ Staff Ex. 7 at 15-17.
    ${ }^{13}$ Staff cited Tex. Att'y Gen. LO-88-78 (1988) for the proposition that promotion of the performing arts is not a purpose for which a fraternal organization may be eligible for a license to conduct bingo. This will be discussed below in greater detail.
    ${ }^{14}$ Staff Ex. 7 at 1.
    ${ }^{15}$ Staff Exs. 7, 9.

[^5]:    ${ }^{16}$ Staff Ex. 10.
    ${ }^{17}$ Staff Ex. 9 at 10-12.

[^6]:    ${ }^{18}$ Staff Ex. 4 at 4-5.
    ${ }^{19}$ Staff Ex. 4 at 5.

[^7]:    ${ }_{2}^{1}$ Transcript (Tr.) at 36.
    ${ }^{2} 1 d$.

[^8]:    ${ }^{3}$ Commission Ex. 7 .

[^9]:    ${ }^{1}$ The attachment "LMS Application Amendment" was an html document and therefore not printable or viewable.

